

5a

Mahā Sakul'udāyi Sutta

The Greater Discourse to Sakul'udāyi | M 77

Theme: Why disciples respect and listen to the Buddha

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2008, 2016

1 Summary and highlights

1.1 TEACHING LIST. The **Mahā Sakul'udāyi Sutta** (M 77) records the wanderer Sakul'udāyi's view that followers of the Buddha respect and follow his teachings on account of 5 reasons [§28]. The Buddha, however, replies that there are 5 more important reasons [2.1] that his followers respect and practise his teachings. The Sutta, in fact, gives a full list of the early Buddhist teachings and practices.

1.2 SUTTA SUMMARY. The Mahā Sakul'udāyi Sutta can be summarized as follows:

- [§§1-3] Since it is too early to enter Rājagaha for alms, the Buddha visits the wanderers' park.
- [§4] Meanwhile the wanderers in the park are conversing with one another in worldly ways.
- [§5] On noticing the Buddha approaching, the wanderer Sakul'udāyi calms the congregation.
- [§§6-8] Sakul'udāyi, clearly embarrassed by the situation, suggests that they talk Dharma.
- [§9] Sakul'udāyi tells the Buddha that there is talk about how fortunate the country (Aṅga-Magadha) is to have so many well known teachers (such as the 6 sectarian teachers) spending the rains retreat there. [§10] Sakul'udāyi adds that they are also blessed with the presence of the Buddha.
- [§11] The people are wondering which of these teachers is truly respected by his followers and who "dwell in dependence" on him, that is, keep to his teachings. [§§12-17] Sakul'udāyi admits that they neither have the respect of their followers nor do the followers keep to their teacher's teachings.
- [§§18-25] However, Sakul'udāyi is impressed with the Buddha, and remarks on how respectful his followers are. [§26] The Buddha asks Sakul'udāyi for the reasons for this. [§27] Sakul'udāyi replies that there are 5 reasons, that is, [§28] the Buddha
- (1) practises moderation in food;
 - (2) he is contented with robes;
 - (3) he is contented with almsfood;
 - (4) he is contented with any lodging; and
 - (5) he practises solitude and speaks in praise of it.
- [§§29-34] The Buddha then explains that many of his disciples live more strictly than he does, so that the 5 reasons given by Sakul'udāyi would actually disqualify the Buddha from being respected and followed by his disciples! [2.1.1]
- [§35] The Buddha tells Sakul'udāyi that he (the Buddha) is respected and followed by his disciples for a different set of 5 reasons, namely,
- (1) that he has higher moral virtue [§36]
 - (2) that he has knowledge and vision [§37]
 - (3) that he has higher wisdom [§38]
 - (4) that he understands the 4 noble truths [§§39-40]
 - (5) that he knows the path to awakening [§§41-61]; for full list, see (1.1.2.1).
- [§62] Joyfully impressed, Sakul'udāyi approves of the Buddha's teaching.

2 Teachings and meditations

2.1 SAKUL'UDĀYI'S ATTITUDE TO THE BUDDHA

2.1.1 Sakul'udāyi's respect for the Buddha.

2.1.1.1 The Mahā Sakul'udāyi Sutta depicts Sakul'udāyi as being very respectful to the Buddha, addressing him as "**venerable Blessed One**" (*bhante bhagavā*) [§6], and addressing him as "**venerable**

sir” (*bhante*) throughout their meeting.¹ Scholars have noted Sakul’udāyi’s anomalous mode of addressing the Buddha.²

Analayo adds: “That the Majjhima Nikāya version might have suffered from some confusion in regard to modes of address becomes evident at a later point, when both versions take up the respect the Buddha’s disciples had for their teacher” (2011:420). He says that only the Buddha’s disciples would address the Buddha in this way [§6].

Furthermore, according to Analayo, in the Madhyama Āgama version, the Buddha describes how his disciples would refer to him as “our Blessed One.” However, in the corresponding Sutta passage, he indicates that his disciples would use the expression “recluse Gotama” to refer to him, an expression that, in other discourses, is regularly employed by outsiders who do not consider themselves disciples of the Buddha.³

Hence, according to the Mahā Sakul’udāyi Sutta, Sakul’udāyi uses what the disciples should have used, while the disciples use the address to be expected of Sakul’udāyi. Analayo concludes, “This presentation may be the outcome of a mix up during the process of transmission” (id).

2.1.1.2 Happily the scholars are wrong; the suttas and reciters have been right all along. We need here to carefully note all the occurrences of “**the recluse Gotama**” (*samaṇo gotamo*), or, at least, when Sakul’udāyi uses the expression. Even more important, we need to note the context in which Sakul’udāyi uses this form of address.

We can narrow down our key passages to §§8-25, where Sakul’udāyi gives the Buddha a very long **report** on the wanderers’ talk regarding which teacher is respected by his disciples who also follow his teaching. Throughout this report, the wanderers, in their review of the Buddha, refer to him as “the recluse Gotama” (*samaṇo gotamo*) [§§10, 18-25]. This is clearly understandable. Sakul’udāyi is here using the first person reported speech, telling the Buddha what they have said.

Sakul’udāyi himself *always* addresses the Buddha as “**venerable sir**” (*bhante*), occasionally adding the title “**Blessed One**” (*bhagavā*). We see a similar honorific, “**lord**” (*bhavata* or *bhagavata*), in the key question, “Who is the lord, revered, respected, esteemed, honoured by his disciples?” [§11.2]. In other words, well known teachers, if they are respected, are often referred to as such. And Sakul’udāyi, despite being a wanderer, is someone who deeply respects the Buddha.

2.1.1.3 Sakul’udāyi is not the only **wanderer who deeply respects the Buddha**. In fact, we have at least two other prominent examples of wanderers who respect the Buddha enough to address him in the same way as Sakul’udāyi does. These wanderers are Poṭṭhapāda and Nigrodha. The background of their express cordiality and respect for the Buddha is very similar to that at the opening in the Mahā Sakul’udāyi Sutta [§6]. However, there are a few differences in the details of what the Buddha is doing before he meets them.

The wanderer Poṭṭhapāda appears in the **Poṭṭhapāda Sutta** (D 9), where he meets the Buddha in the “tinduka-encircled single hall” in Mallikā’s park for public debates, outside Sāvattthī. As it is too early to enter the town for alms, the Buddha visits Poṭṭhapāda, who welcomes him warmly, at once addressing him as a respected teacher, that is, as “venerable Blessed One” or “bhante lord” (*bhante bhagavā*),⁴ and then consistently addressing the Buddha as “bhante.”

The wanderer Nigrodha, as reported in the **Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda Sutta** (D 25) is an interesting person because he is (unlike Sakul’udāyi) very critical of the Buddha. When the layman non-returner San-

¹ The Chin version, however, reports Sakul’udāyi as addressing the Buddha by his name “Gotama,” like other outsiders (MĀ 207 @ T1.781c21: 瞿曇 *qūtán*).

² Allon thinks that here “the use of *bhante* ‘venerable sir’ is particularly unusual as a form of address used by an ascetic towards the Buddha, as is the ascetic referring to the Buddha as *Bhagavā*” (1997a:121).

³ MĀ 207 (T1.782c24 + T1.783a1+6+11+17): “our Blessed One,” 我世尊 *wǒ shì zūn*, and, in the Sutta, the Buddha addresses himself as “recluse Gotama” (*samaṇo gotamo*) at §30.1 (M 2:7,2), §30.2 (M 2,18), §31.1 (M 2:8,1), § (M 2:8,17, (M 2:8,34). According to Wagle, the mode of address “*samaṇa*, although a term of respect, denotes a certain indifference” (1966:56).

⁴ D 9,5.2/1:179 (SD 7.14).

dhāna drops in at Udumbarikā wanderers' park early one morning, Nigrodha, after welcoming him, makes these unflattering remarks:

“The recluse Gotama is destroyed by the solitary life. He is awkward in an assembly. He is no good at conversation. Just as a one-eyed cow,⁵ walking in circles, keeps to the fringes (of a field), the recluse Gotama is only occupied with the fringes of things ... we will baffle him with a single question, we will knock him over like an empty pot!”⁶

However, when the Buddha actually visits him that same morning, he welcomes the Buddha just like Potthapāda or Sakul'udāyi, addressing him as “venerable Blessed One,” and speaks cordially with him, addressing as “bhante” throughout. The Sutta records the Buddha as having a dialogue with Nigordha, answering his question on the nature of the core of spiritual training.⁷

2.1.1.4 We have thus clearly solved the two apparent problems regarding **the Mahā Sakul'udāyi Sutta**. Firstly, Sakul'udāyi does not vacillate in his way of respectfully addressing the Buddha—as speculated by Analayo [2.1.1.1], but consistently addresses the Buddha as “bhante” [2.1.1.2]. The apparent problem arises when we fail to distinguish the actual speaker in Sakul'udāyi's report on the wanderers' talk.

Interestingly, we see **the Buddha** as consistently addressing himself as “recluse Gotama” (*samaṇo gotamo*) when he voices in the first person the wanderers' views of him [§§29-40]. This shows that the Buddha is simply reflecting the minds of others as they are, without insisting that he be addressed in some respectful or honorific way.

2.1.1.5 The second apparent problem—such as that raised by Mark Allon—is that of the wanderers and outsiders *not*, as a rule, addressing the Buddha respectfully, especially not as “Bhante” or “Blessed One” [2.1.1.1]. This may well be the rule, but in the cases of Sakul'udāyi and Potthapāda, we see sensible individuals, who despite being wanderers, still show deep respect for a worthy teacher.

Even the arrogant Nigrodha, in **the Udumbarikā Siha,nāda Sutta** (D 25)—apparently, arrogant only in the Buddha's absence—either bows to common courtesy or is moved by the Buddha's personality, in the latter's presence. On meeting the Buddha, he at once addresses the Buddha as “venerable Blessed One” and consistently addressing him as “bhante” throughout their conversation [2.1.1.3].

However, it is unlikely that common courtesy is the only reason here—a wanderer addressing the Buddha as “recluse Gotama” would be courteous enough. After all, the Buddha himself often addresses those he meets or instructs either as “brahmins,” or “household”—that is, according to their social status—or by name, especially when he sees them as being amenable to instruction, and able to benefit from the Dharma.

In short, we have to avoid stereotyping the conduct of any social group, in its attitude towards the Buddha. The people who meet the Buddha, as a rule, do so as individuals. If they have any wisdom, they will respond wholesomely to his instruction. After all, it is the Buddha, the wisest of the teachers of his times, and also a fully awakened person. Meeting such a person, as a rule, has some kind of positive impact upon us.

2.1.1.6 The most vital lesson for those of us interested in the suttas is to remember that they are the Buddha Word (albeit a sort of transcript of his teachings compiled and edited by reciters and redactors), and that we should allow the suttas to speak for themselves. Even if we try to examine the suttas as “literature” or as an academic exercise, we must remember that the suttas are no ordinary or secular literature, but the recording of some of the greatest adventures and advances in human spirituality.

In other words, if we look through the lens of a scholar, the lens should neither distort the teachings nor hinder us from seeing without the lens. Above all, we should simply be curious about a sutta—What is it trying to say? Why is the teaching presented in this way? It is most rewarding if we approach the suttas as an individual (whatever our training or inclination), that is, to see the truth and beauty of ancient

⁵ *Go,kāṇā*; cf *go,kaṇṇa*, “a large species of deer, J 5:406” (PED). D:W has “bison.” D:RD and here follow the Comy. Cf *go,maṇḍala va parinesi* (“led around in a circle like a cow”): see Tha 1143 @ SD 20.9.

⁶ D 25,5/3:38 @ SD 1.4.

⁷ D 25/3:36-57 @ SD 1.4.

wisdom. Then, we will be well rewarded with academic excellence or professional success, and with the awakening of a true seeker. We will truly understand what it means to read and live the suttas.

2.1.2 Sakul’udāyi’s 5 reasons

2.1.2.1 **Sakul’udāyi**, unlike the other wanderers, appears in the Sutta as some kind of cultivated religious,⁸ who deeply respects the Buddha. However, his respect is based on his own wanderer’s lifestyle, that is, in terms of the worldly or physical supports (*paccaya*) of almsfood, robes, shelter and solitude. He is reported to have known the 6 sectarian teachers, but is simply unimpressed by their inadequacies. [§§12-17]

2.1.2.2 **The Buddha** rejects the 5 reasons that his followers respect and keep to his teachings [1.2, §28], as given by Sakul’udāyi, because, they are external observances, concerning food, robes, lodging and solitude. If these 5 qualities were the criteria for respect and discipleship, then those who are stricter (in their ascetic practices) would not respect or follow the Buddha. [§§29-33].

2.2 THE BUDDHA’S FIFTH “REASON”

2.2.1 “Meditation methods.” The Buddha’s followers respect and follow him, not for *external* religious reasons, but for *internal* or spiritual reasons. The 5 reasons given by the Buddha actually refer to a total of 23 sets of teachings, with the fifth (“the path to awakening”) forming the main bulk of them, with a total of 19 teachings, covering more than half the Sutta itself, thus:

1	Higher moral virtue	<i>adhisīla</i>	[§36]			
2	Knowledge and vision	<i>ñāṇa, dassana</i>	[§37]			
3	Higher wisdom	<i>adhipaññā</i>	[§38]			
4	The 4 noble truths	<i>catu ariya, sacca</i>	[§§39-40]			
5	The path to awakening [§§14-59]					
	(1) the 4 focuses of mindfulness,		[§41]	}	the “7 sets” ⁹ = the 37 limbs of awakening (<i>bodhi, pakkhiya dhamma</i>)	
	(2) the 4 right strivings,		[§42]			
	(3) the 4 paths of spiritual power,		[§43]			
	(4) the 5 spiritual faculties		[§44]			
	(5) the 5 spiritual powers		[§45]			
	(6) the 7 awakening-factors		[§46]			
	(7) the noble eightfold path		[§47]			
	(8) the 8 liberations	<i>aṭṭha vimokkha</i>	[§48; 3]	}	Dhyana-based practices	
	(9) the 8 bases of mastery	<i>aṭṭha abhibh’āyatana</i>	[§49; 4]			
	(10) the 10 kasina-bases	<i>dasa kasiṇ’āyatana</i>	[§50]	}	The “comprehensive dhyana pericope,” Sāmaññaphala Sutta (D 2,76-88), SD 8.10	
	(11) the 4 dhyanas		[§51]			
	(12) insight knowledge of the conscious body		[§52]			
	(13) knowledge of the mind-made body		[§53]	}	the 6 superknowledges (<i>cha-l-abhiññā</i>)	
	(14) psychic powers		[§54]			
	(15) the divine ear (clairaudience)		[§55]			
	(16) mind-reading		[§56]			
	(17) knowledge of the recollection of past lives		[§57]			
	(18) the divine eye (knowledge of karma)		[§58]			
	(19) knowledge of the destruction of mental influxes		[§59]			
	Total number of <u>individual teachings</u> : 75.				}	“Fruits of recluseship pericope” <i>sāmañña, phala</i> (D 2,76-100)

Table 2.2.1 The 5 reasons

⁸ Here, “religious” is a noun, meaning “a person given up to a religious or monastic life” (OED), broadly, any monk, nun, wanderer, or any member of a religious order; fem “religieuse.”

⁹ See *Bodhi, pakkhiya, dhamma*, SD 10.1.

2.2.2 Rationale of the sequence

2.2.2.1 According to **the Mahā Sakul’udāyi Sutta** (M 77), there are 5 reasons why the followers of the Buddha *revere, respect, esteem, and honour him and keep to this teaching* (“dwell in dependence on him”)¹⁰ [§§36-61]. The first four reasons [2.1.1] can be summarized as the Buddha’s “knowledge and conduct” (*vijjā, carāṇa*), that is, the 3rd of the 9 virtues (*guṇa*), those that we should reflect on.¹¹

The fifth and last of these reasons is that the Buddha explains to his followers the way to awakening [2.2]. This “way to awakening” is actually a list of teachings closely related to dhyana. It is also the most elaborate list in the Sutta, covering about two-thirds of the Sutta itself!

2.2.2.2 From **Table 2.2.1**, we can see that the first seven of the list in **the 5th “reason”** actually comprise the well known **7 sets** [2.2.2.1(5)]. The “5th reason” list is then extended following a numerical progression. After the 7 sets, then, we have two sets of eight qualities—the 8 liberations (*vimokkha*) and the 8 bases of mastery (*abhibh’āyatana*)—which is then followed by a set of 10—the 10 kasina-bases (*kaṣiṇ’-āyatana*).

The liberations and the bases of mastery, however, are two categories that are not specifically discussed at great length in the suttas or the later literature. This is partly because they seem to overlap with the matters dealt with in detail under the more general headings of dhyana and formless attainment, loosely known as the “8 dhyanas.”

The Dhamma,saṅgaṇī, for example, explains the bases of mastery in terms of mastery and facility in certain aspects of dhyana practice.¹² In fact, both the liberations¹³ and the bases of mastery¹⁴ directly relate to the cultivation and experience of the form dhyanas and the formless attainments.¹⁵

2.2.2.3 While the liberations and bases of mastery are concerned with the personal experience of meditation and dhyana, **the 10 kasina-bases**,¹⁶ on the other hand, are more central to the exposition of theoretical dhyana in such works as the Vimutti,magga and the Visuddhi,magga.¹⁷

Having reached the 10 kasina-bases by way of numerical progression, the Mahā Sakul’udāyi Suttā breaks away for the numerical sequence, and next presents **the 4 dhyanas**. Beginning with the dhyanas, then, we have a new series, a set of 9 items, that is, the “fruits of recluseship” pericope. [Table 2.2.1]

2.2.2.4 The eight items [M 77,11-19] that follow the dhyanas are the same 8 items following the dhyanas in **the “fruits of recluseship” (sāmañña,phala) pericope**. In effect, Gethin (2001:268) observes that we apparently have **two lists**: one list consists of **the 7 sets along with the 8 liberations, 8 bases of mastery, and 10 kasina-bases**; the other list is **the “fruits of recluseship” pericope** beginning with the 5 dhyanas and ending with arhathood (the destruction of the mental influxes).¹⁸

2.3 THE 75 ‘MEDITATION OBJECTS’

2.3.1 Of particular interest is that the Sutta lists in full the 75 individual teachings in much the same way as in **the Jhāna Vagga** of the Aṅguttara Nikāya. To be listed in the chapter on dhyana (*jhāna*) clear-

¹⁰ *Pañca dhammā yehi mama sāvakāi sakkaronti garu, karonti māinenti pūjenti sakkatvā garukatvā upanissāya viharanti.*

¹¹ On the Buddha’s 9 virtues (*navāraha guṇa*), see SD 15.7 (3).

¹² Dhs 42-52 where the 8 bases of mastery (with slight variations from the Nikāya formulation) are treated as an aspect of form dhyana; cf DhsA 87-90. On the bases of mastery, see SD 49.5b (2).

¹³ SD 49.5b (1).

¹⁴ SD 49.5b (2).

¹⁵ The 4th, 5th, 6th and 7th liberations correspond respectively to the 4 formless attainments; the 8th liberation is the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling (*saññā, vedayita, nirodha*). The formulation of the 2nd liberation (*ajjhataṃ arūpa, saññī bahiddhā rūpāni passati*) suggests that it is a shorthand for all 8 bases of mastery which consist of variations on the theme, *ajjhataṃ arūpa, saññī eko bahiddhā rūpam passati*. For a more detailed exposition of the liberations (*vimokkha*), see Pm 2:38-40.

¹⁶ SD 49.5b (3).

¹⁷ Dhs 31-42 gives only 8 kasinas; Vimmi has all 10 kasinas, incl consciousness (*viññāṇa*). Vism also has 10 but with “light” (*āloka*) for “consciousness” (*viññāṇa*). On Vimutti,magga and Visuddhi,magga, see (3.2.5) & SD 48.5b (1.0.1.2).

¹⁸ On the fruits of recluseship (*sāmañña,phala*), see **Sāmañña,phala Sutta** (D 2,76-100), SD 8.10.

ly means that these teachings are conducive to dhyana practice. In this sense, they can be called “meditation objects” or dhyana-centred teachings.

The 75 “**meditation objects**” concerned with dhyana listed in the Mahā Sakul’udāyi Sutta comprise the following teachings are actually the 19 sets comprising the “path to awakening” [§§44-62]. This is, in fact, the 5th of the reason that the Buddha gives on account of which his followers respect him and follow his teachings.

2.3.2 The Mahā Sakul’udāyi Sutta lists a total of 75 teachings.¹⁹ These teachings, however, are similarly listed in **the Jhāna Vagga**, as we have noted [2.3.1]. However, clearly missing from the “75 teachings” list are

- the 4 divine abodes (*brahma, vihāra*),²⁰
- the 20 perceptions (*saññā*),²¹ and
- the 10 recollections²²

a total of 70 meditation methods, all listed in the Jhāna Vagga. Combining the different teachings from the two lists, we have a total of **145 “meditation methods,”** here meaning teachings connected with the attaining of dhyanas.

3 Teaching problems

3.1 TWO PROBLEMS

3.1.1 There are two interesting problems related to **the Maha Sakul’udāyi**. The first is its length and subject treatment. The Sutta is extraordinarily long (22 duodecimo pages or 7”×4” of Pali print in the PTS edition), and considering its impressive listing of teachings (rather than of an instructive in nature), it would well have been more appropriately located in the Dīgha Nikāya.

3.1.2 Secondly, it is difficult to actually isolate any single teaching in the Sutta: it seems to simply present the teachings, without giving any meditation instruction. It is simply a catalogue of teachings related to meditation, especially dhyana.

3.2 LIBERATION, MASTERY AND KASINAS

3.2.1 The presence of two obscure teachings—those of the 8 liberations (*aṭṭha vimokkha*)²³ and the 8 bases of mastery (*abhibh’āyatana*)²⁴—is also curious. Not much is known of either list from the suttas themselves nor are they elaborated in later literature. Gethin observes that “this at least in part appears to be because they are considered to overlap with matters dealt with in detail under the more general headings of *jhāna* and formless attainment.” (2001:267)

In **the Dhamma,saṅgaṇī** (the first book of the Abhidhamma), for example, the bases of mastery seem to be concerned with “mastery and facility in certain aspects of *jhāna* practice”²⁵ (id). The 8 liberations, too, embrace both form dhyanas and formless attainments.²⁶

3.2.2 We can only glean some information from the lists themselves, which give some details. **The 8 liberations**, for example, deal with the 8 dhyanas. “Liberation” (*vimokkha*), except in the last (8th) case, refers only to a temporary release from the hindrances and opposing states. The first 3 liberations refer to those based on form dhyanas, while the next 3 refer to the formless attainments, and the last is the cessation of perception and feeling, experienced only by arhats and non-returners.

3.2.3 Similarly, little is known about **the 8 bases of mastery**. We know, however, it attempts, for example, to resort to colours from the natural world as a basis for dhyana meditation. The “internal

¹⁹ See SD 49.5b (0.1) + Table 0.2.

²⁰ The 4 divine abodes (*brahma, vihāra*) cycle: A 1.20.143-182/42 = A:B 1.535-574/129 (40 meditations).

²¹ The 20 perceptions (*saññā*): A 1.20.73-92/41 f = A:B 1.465-484/128 (20 meditations).

²² The 10 recollections (*anussati*): A 1.20.93-102/42 = A:B 485-494/128 (10 meditations).

²³ On the 8 liberations, see SD 49.5b (3).

²⁴ On the 8 bases of mastery, see SD 49.5b (2).

²⁵ See Dhs 42-52, where the 8 bases of mastery (with slight variations from the sutta listing) are treated as an aspect of form dhyana; cf Dhs 187-190.

²⁶ On the 8 liberations, see SD 49.5b (3).

forms” are the pure colours derived from within the body, such as red for blood, and white for the bone or teeth. The “external forms” refer to natural colours, such as those of flowers, and also the use of kasina devices, or colour discs specially designed for meditation.²⁷

3.2.4 It is highly likely that these two teachings are late developments during the canonical period or just after, when these lists were popular. These lists were probably used as mnemonics for various techniques of dhyana meditation which were already well known, so that instructions were orally and personally given by the meditation instructor, and no textual tradition resulted from this “living” tradition. Clearly, these two lists are post-Buddha. Otherwise, they would have had records of his instructions in some useful details, but none of them seem to exist.

3.2.5 The 10 kasinas (*kaṣiṇa*)—or “kasina-bases” (*kaṣiṇ’āyatana*), as they are called in the Sutta—are more related to the theory and practice of dhyana in such works as the *Vimutti,magga*, and the *Visuddhi,magga*, on which it is based.²⁸ This set is located by way of numerical progression, following the “7 sets,” the 8 liberations and the 8 bases of mastery [2.1.2]. These last 2 sets and the 10 kasina-bases form a set of teachings closely connected with dhyana.²⁹

— — —

The Greater Discourse to Sakul’udāyi

M 77

[1] Thus have I heard.

The Buddha descides to meet Sakul’udāyi

1 At one time, the Blessed One was staying in the squirrels’ feeding ground,³⁰ in the Bamboo Grove [Veḷu,vana], outside Rājagaha.

2 At that time, some very well known wanderers were living in the wanderers’ park in the peacocks’ feeding ground³¹—that is to say, the wanderers Anna,bhāra,³² Vara,dhara, Sakul’udāyi and various other very well known wanderers.

3 Then, early in the morning, the Blessed One, having dressed himself, took his robe and bowl, and entered Rājagaha for his almsround.

Then, it occurred to the Blessed One,

²⁷ For a description, see Sarah Shaw 2006:93.

²⁸ **Vimutti,magga** (Vimm), “the path to freedom,” is an Indian Abhidhamma text, attr to Upatissa, who composed it between 3rd and 5th cent, prob in northern India. Today it is only extant in its Chin tr (T1648 @ T32.399c-461c), by Saṅghapāla of Funan (Tan 2004:§11.1) in 505. Parts of it were tr into Tib (D306; Q972). Although it is known by its putative Pali title, its orig language is unknown. The work was known to Buddhaghosa, who used it for his **Vi-suddhi,magga** (Vism) (5th cent), without credit, following its structure of the 3 trainings. Vism, however, is a more comprehensive work, presenting the view of the Mahāvihāra tradition in Sri Lanka, while the Vimm represent the Abhayagiri view. See Ency Bsm: Vimuttimaggā.

²⁹ On the practical aspects of the liberations, bases of mastery, and the kasina-bases, see SD 49.5b (0.3.3).

³⁰ “The squirrels’ feeding ground,” *kalandaka.nivāpa*, a woodland in Veḷuvana, north of Rājagaha, where the Buddha often dwells. Prob identical with present-day Karaṇḍa tank. See BHSD sv; DPPN: Kalandakanivāpa.

³¹ “The peacocks’ feeding ground,” *mora.nivāpa*, a woodland beside the Sumāgadhā lotus lake, in Veḷuvana [prec n] where peacocks are protected (DA 3:835; MA 3:235). Nearby is the Udumbarikā wanderers’ park (*paribbājak’-ārāma*) [D 25,1 n, SD 1.4], and is the venue of the teaching of **Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda S** (D 25), SD 1.4, **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77), SD 49.5a, and **Cūḷa Sakul’udāyi S** (M 79), SD 91.4.

³² Rāja,gaha, capital of Magadha. See **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,1.1.1) n + SD 9 (16.3).

“It’s too early to go for almsround in Rājagaha.³³ Now, what if I were to go to the wanderers’ park in the peacocks’ feeding ground, and approach the wanderer Sakul’udāyi?”

The wanderers in the peacocks’ feeding ground

4 ³⁴Then, the Blessed One went to the wanderers’ park in the peacocks’ feeding ground.

4.2 Now, at that time the wanderer Sakul’udāyi was sitting with a large crowd of wanderers, all talking loudly, shouting, making loud noises, and indulging in various **low talk**,³⁵ that is to say, talk about kings, robbers, ministers of state; about armies, dangers, and wars; about food and drink; about clothing, beds [furniture], garlands, and scents; about relatives; about vehicles; about villages, towns, cities, the countryside; about women and heroes; gossips of the street and at the well; [2] tales of the dead; tales of diversity [philosophical discussions of the past and future], talk about the creation of the world and of the sea, and talk of whether things exist or not [talk about gain and loss].³⁶

5 Then, the wanderer Sakul’udāyi saw the Blessed One approaching from a distance, and he called his own company of followers to order, saying:

“Good sirs, be quiet please! Don’t make a noise, good sirs! The recluse Gotama is approaching. This venerable one is fond of quiet and praises quiet.³⁷ If he sees that this company is quiet, he will most likely want to come and visit us.”³⁸

When this was said, the wanderers fell silent.

6 ³⁹Then, the Blessed One approached the wanderer Sakul’udāyi, who then said:

“Please come, venerable Blessed One!⁴⁰ Welcome, venerable Blessed One! It’s been a long time since the venerable Blessed One has found the occasion to come here.⁴¹ Let the venerable Blessed One take a seat. Here is a seat that has been prepared.”

7 The Blessed One sat down on the prepared seat, and the wanderer Sakul’udāyi, taking a low seat, sat down at one side.

³³ *Atippago kho tāva rājagahe piṇḍāya carituṃ.*

³⁴ §§4-5 recurs mutatis mutandis in **Sandaka S** (M 76,4-5), SD 35.7; cf **Udumbārikā Sīha,nāda S** (D 25,2-3), SD 1.4.

³⁵ *Tiracchāna,kathā*, lit “animal talk.” As animals mostly walk parallel to the earth, so this kind of talk does not lead on upwards. This section is *mutatis mutandis* as at **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9,3/1:178 f). Cf **Lohicca S** (D 1:228). For a more complete list, called “the moralities” (*sīla*), see **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1.43-62/1:4-12), SD 25.2 & Intro (3), & **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,43-63/ 1:63-70), SD 8.10 & Intro (3). See SID: *tiracchāna,kathā*.

³⁶ *Iti,bhavābhāva,kathā* may be rendered as “being and non-being” or as “profit and loss,” but Walshe (D:W 386) takes it only in a philosophical sense (as does Horner and also Nāṇamoli in their trs of **Sandaka S**, M 76).

³⁷ *Appa,sadda,kāmā kho pana so āyasmā appa,saddassa vaṇṇa,vādī*: mutatis mutandis at **Udumbarika Sīha,nāda S** (D 25,3/3:37, 6/3:39 sg); **Sandaka S** (M 76,4/1:514), **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77,4/2:2 sg), **Samāṇa Muṇḍika S** (M 78,3/2:23), **Cūḷa Sakul’udāyi S** (M 79,4/2:30 sg); **Kim Diṭṭhika S** (A 10,93,2/5:185), **Vajjiya Māhita S** (A 10,94,2/5:190). Only M 67 first reading has *ete*, while the others omit it (or use *te*).

³⁸ The passage is stock: **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9,4/1:179), SD 7.14; **Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda S** (D 25,6,2/3:39), SD 1.4 (with additional remark); **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77,5/2:2), SD 49.5a.

³⁹ §§6-7 recurs mutatis mutandis in **Sandaka S** (76,6-7), SD 35.7; cf **Udumbārikā Sīha,nāda S** (D 25,7,1-2), SD 1.4.

⁴⁰ On Sakul’udāyi’s respectful way of addressing the Buddha, see (2.1.1.2).

⁴¹ “Please come, ... to come here,” *etu kho bhante Bhagavā svagataṃ bhante Bhagavato, cirassam kho marisā imam pariyaṃ akāsi yad idam idh’āgamanāya*, using the 3rd imp sg *etu* (“Let...come!”) as a polite formality (D 25,7a/3:39); also at **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9,5/1:179), SD 7.14; **Gopaka Moggallāna S** (M 108,4/3:7), SD 33.5. In the phrase, *pariyaṃ akasi*, “made it an occasion.” In the phrase, *pariyaṃ akasi*, “made it an occasion,” Comy glosses *pariyaṃ* as *vāra* (“occasion, opportunity”) (UA 115). This is stock: **D** 1:90 (DA 2:369), 179 (see D:RD 1:245 n2), **2**:270, **3**:2, 39; **M** 1:252 (MA 2:300 f), 326, 481, **2**:2, 30, **3**:7; **S** 1:142; **A** 3:332 (AA 3:363), **4**:76; **U** 13 (UA 115); **J** 3:359. In **Brahma Nimantanika S** (M 49), Baka Brahmā says: *ehi kho marisā, sāgataṃ marisā, cirassam kho marisā imam pariyaṃ akāsi yadidam idh’āgamanāya*.

Having sat down on the prepared seat, the Blessed One said this to him:⁴²

“Sakul’udāyi, what is the talk you are having, sitting together here? And what is the conversation that is left unfinished?”⁴³

SAKUL’UDĀYI’S REPORT

OR, THE WANDERERS’ TALK

[§§8-25]

“Who is the lord?”

8 ⁴⁴“Never mind the talk, bhante, for the sake of the talk for which we have now gathered!⁴⁵ It will not be difficult for you, bhante, to hear this talk later.

9 In recent days, bhante, when recluses and brahmins of diverse sects gathered and sat together in the debating hall,⁴⁶ **this topic arose**:

9.2 ‘What a gain, sirs, for the people of Aṅga-Magadha,⁴⁷ what a great gain, sirs, for the people of Aṅga-Magadha, that these recluses and brahmins, heads of an order, heads of a group [congregation], congregation teachers, well known and famous, ford-makers [who bring others across the river of suffering], regarded as good⁴⁸ by the masses, have come to Rājagaha for the rains-retreat.⁴⁹

(1) There is this Pūraṇa Kassapa, *the head of an order, head of a group [congregation], congregation teacher, well known and famous, ford-maker, regarded as good by the masses, who has come to Rājagaha for the rains-retreat.*⁵⁰

⁴² This episode of the Buddha interrupting an “unfinished conversation” (*antarā,kathā vippakatā*) is stock, eg, D 1.1.4/1:2; D 2.7a/3:39 f; M 119.2/3:89, U 2.2/11.

⁴³ *Kāya nu’ttha, bho ānanda, etarahi kathāya sannisinnā, kā ca pana vo antarā,kathā vippakatā ti?* This is stock, where the person interrupting is usu the Buddha, eg, D 1.1.4/1:2; M 108.6/3:8 (the brahmin Vassa,kāra), 119,2/3:89, U 2.2/11; J 4/1:120

⁴⁴ Sakul’udāyi’s talk starts here and continues until §25 [2.1]. This is an example of a “nested narrative” (up to 3 layers deep): see SD 30.8 (4.2.1)+n.

⁴⁵ *Tiṭṭhat’esā bhante kathā, yāya mayam etarahi kathāya sannisinnā.* There is a hint of embarrassment in Sakul’-udāyi here, to suggest that he would rather talk with the Buddha himself.

⁴⁶ “The debating-hall,” *kutūhala,sālā*, lit “commotion hall,” a place where ascetics and brahmins of other sects engage in various discussions; so named on account of the frequent commotion, “What does this one say? What does that one say?” (SA 3:114). Apparently, there is no building named as such (*pacceka,sālā n’atthi*), as it is a generic term for a place of discussion (MA 3:235; SA 3:114). See **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9,1/1:178), SD 7.14 n. See also **Kutūhala,sālā S** (S 44.9), SD 23.15

⁴⁷ *Aṅga,magadha.* A dvandva comprising Aṅga + Magadha. **Aṅga**, with its capital at Campā (Campā,purī), a large town at the confluence of the Campā river (prob modern Candan) and the Ganges, and doubtless represented by the two villages of Campananagara and Campapura, 34 km (24 mi) east of modern Bhagalpur. Just across the Campā river is **Magadha**, which extended westward to the Son river (corresponding roughly to present Patna and Gaya districts of South Bihar). Its capital is Rāja,gaha, also known as Giri-b,baja (Tha 1097 n, SD 20.9). .

⁴⁸ Although it is possible to freely render *sādhu* here as a noun, meaning “saint(s),” this sense is only popular in recent times.

⁴⁹ The phrase, “These recluses ...” etc, *ime samaṇa,brāhmaṇā saṅghino gaṇiṇo gaṇ’ācariyā ñātā yasassino tittha,karā sādhu,sammataḥ bahu,janassa* is stock: **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16,5.26/2:150), SD 9; **Cūḷa Sārōpama S** (M 30,2/1:198), SD 53.9; “for the rains-retreat,” *vass’āvasam osaṭā*, **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77,8/2:2), SD 49.5a; **Dahara S** (S 3.1/1:68), SD 42.11; **Sabhiya S** (Sn 3.6/p91×3), SD 77.8. Some texts immediately list the 6 teachers: *seyyath’idam pūraṇo kassapo, makkhali go,sālo, ajito kesa,kambalo, pakudho kaccāyano, sañjajo belatṭha,putto, nigaṇṭho nāṭa,putto*: D 9/2:150; M 1:198; S 1:68; Sn p91×3. Here, each of the 6 teachers is treated in detail.

⁵⁰ This is the first of the 6 non-Buddhist teachers (*titthiyā*), all recluses (*samaṇā*), ie, part of the reform movement against the brahminical tradition. Only here they are listed separately. Their key teachings: Pūraṇa Kassapa: anti-nomian ethics; Makkhali Gosāla: fatalism or determinism; Ajita Kesambalī: materialism; Pakudha Kaccāyana:

(2) *There is this Makkhali Gosāla ... too.*

(3) *There is this Ajita Kesambalī ... too.*

(4) *There is this Pakudha Kaccāyana ... too.*

(5) *There is this Sañjaya Belaṭṭhi,putta ... too.*

(6) *There is this Nigaṇṭha Nātha,putta, the head of an order, head of a group [congregation], congregation teacher; [3] well known and famous, ford-maker, regarded as good by the masses, who has come to Rājagaha for the rains-retreat, too.*

10 *This recluse Gotama, the head of an order, head of a group [congregation], congregation teacher, well known and famous, ford-maker, regarded as good by the masses—he, too, has come to Rājagaha for the rains-retreat.*

11 *Now, of these recluses and brahmins, heads of an order, heads of a group, congregation teachers, well known and famous, ford-makers, regarded as good by the masses,*

11.2 **who is the lord,**⁵¹ *revered, respected, esteemed, honoured by his disciples?*⁵²

*And how, having honoured, respected, do these disciples dwell in dependence on him?*⁵³

The 6 teachers scorned by their own disciples

12 (1) Here, some speak thus:

‘There is this **Pūraṇa Kassapa**, the head of an order, and head of a group, and congregation teacher, and well known and famous, and a ford-maker, who is also regarded as good by the masses!

But he is *not* revered, *not* respected, *not* esteemed, *not* honoured by his disciples,

and these disciples, having neither honoured nor respected Pūraṇa Kassapa, do *not* dwell in dependence on him.

13 *Once, Pūraṇa Kassapa was teaching his Dharma to an assembly of several hundreds.*

*There, a certain disciple of Pūraṇa Kassapa made a noise, and said:*⁵⁴

“Sirs, do not ask Pūraṇa Kassapa about that matter; he does not know it. We know it! Ask us about that matter. We can explain that to you, sirs!”

14 *Once, Pūraṇa Kassapa stretched out his arm, but failed even when he was wailing,*

“Be quiet, sirs, make no noise. They are not asking you, sirs! They are asking us! We will answer them!”

14.2 *But many of Pūraṇa Kassapa’s disciples, having refuted him, left, saying,*

“You do not understand the Doctrine and Discipline! We understand the Dharma-Vinaya!

How could you understand this Dharma-Vinaya?

You have practised the wrong way! I’m practising the right way!

I’m consistent! You are inconsistent!

What should have been said first, you said later! What should have been said later, you said first!

What you have thought out has been overturned!

Your doctrine has been refuted! You are humiliated!

Go unravel yourself, free yourself from your own arguments, if you can!”⁵⁵

atomism; Sañjaya Belaṭṭhi,putta: agnosticism; and Nigaṇṭha Nātha,putta: the fourfold restraints. For details, see **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,16-33/1:52-59) & Jaini 1970:57-61.

⁵¹ *Ko nu kho ... bhavatam* (so Be Ce Se; Ee *bhagavatam*). *Bhavatam* is genitive of *bhavant*, “sir, lord; venerable, honourable” as honorific “you.” *Bhagavatam* is unattested

⁵² This life: *ko nu kho ... sakkato garukato mānito pūjito*.

⁵³ *Kañ ca pana sāvaka sakkatvā garuṃ katvā upanissāya viharantīti*. Here, dependence (*upanissaya*), has a broad sense of respect for the teacher and practising the teaching. A more specialized term is “tutelage” (*nissaya*), also tr as “dependence,” specifically refers to a minimum of the first 5 years of a monk or a nun, spent serving and learning from an experienced teacher so that the neophyte actually *becomes* a renunciant in action, in learning and in spirit (in body, head and heart): see SD 40a.8 (4.2.2.3).

⁵⁴ *Tatr’aññataro pūraṇassa kassapassa sāvako saddam akāsi*.

14.3 Thus, Pūraṇa Kassapa is *not* revered, *not* respected, *not* esteemed, *not* honoured by his disciples,
and these disciples, having neither honoured nor respected, Pūraṇa Kassapa, do *not* dwell in dependence on him.

14.4 Indeed, Pūraṇa Kassapa is scorned on account of his own scornful nature.⁵⁶ [4]

15 (2) Here, some speak thus: ‘There is this **Makkhali Go,sāla ...**’

(3) Here, some speak thus: ‘There is this **Ajīta Kesa,kambala ...**’

(4) Here, some speak thus: ‘There is this **Pakudha Kaccāyana ...**’

(5) Here, some speak thus: ‘There is this **Sañjaya Belaṭṭha,putta ...**’

(6) Here, some speak thus:

‘There is this **Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa,putta**, the head of an order, and head of a group, and congregation teacher, and well known and famous, and a ford-maker, who is also regarded as good by the masses! But he is not revered, not respected, not esteemed, not honoured by his disciples, and these disciples, having neither honoured nor respected Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa,putta, do not dwell in dependence on him.

16 Once, Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa,putta was teaching his Dharma to an assembly of several hundreds.

There, a certain disciple of Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa,putta made a noise, and said:

“Sirs, do not ask Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa,putta about that matter; he does not know it. I know it! Ask us about that matter. We can explain that to you sirs!”

17 Once, Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa,putta stretched out his arm, but failed even when he was wailing,

“Be quiet, sirs, make no noise. They are not asking you, sirs! They are asking us! We will answer them!”

17.2 But many of Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa,putta’s disciples, having refuted him, left, saying,

“You do not understand the Doctrine and Discipline! I understand the Dharma-Vinaya!

How could you understand this Dharma-Vinaya?

You have practised the wrong way! I am practising the right way!

I am consistent! You are inconsistent!

What should have been said first, you said later! What should have been said later, you said first!

What you have thought out has been overturned!

Your doctrine has been refuted! You are humiliated!

Go unravel yourself, free yourself from your own arguments, if you can!”

17.3 Thus, Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa,putta is not revered, not respected, not esteemed, not honoured by his disciples,

and these disciples, having neither honoured nor respected, Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa,putta, do not dwell in dependence on him.

17.4 Indeed, Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa,putta is scorned on account of his own scornful nature.’

The Buddha is well respected

18 Here, some speak thus:

‘It is this **recluse Gotama**, the head of an order, and head of a group, and congregation teacher, and well known and famous, and a ford-maker, who is also regarded as good by the masses!

He is revered, respected, esteemed, honoured by his disciples,

and these disciples, having honoured and respected the recluse Gotama, dwell in dependence on him.

⁵⁵ *Cara vāda-p,pamokkhāya nibbeṭhehi vā sace pahosīti*. Cf *iti,vāda-p,pamokkh’ānisaṃsa*: **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22,29/1:133), SD 3.13; **Kuṇḍaliya S** (S 46.6,3/5:73) n, SD 35.3; **Brahma,cariya S** (A 4.25/2:26), SD 37.4(3.3).

⁵⁶ *Akkuṭṭho ca pana pūraṇo kassapo dhamm’akkosenā’ti*. Comy glosses *dhamma-k,kosena* as “by the inherent nature of scorn” or “scornful by nature” (MA 3:237). Alt tr: “... by the scorn shown to his Dharma” (M:ÑB). This phrase seems to occur only here (a hapax legomenon).

19 Once, the recluse Gotama was teaching Dharma to an assembly of several hundreds.

Then, a certain disciple of the recluse Gotama cleared his throat.⁵⁷

19.2 A certain fellow brahmachari then nudged him with his knee, and said,

“Let the venerable be quiet. **[5]** Let the venerable not make a noise. The teacher, the Blessed One, is teaching the Dharma.”

20 When the recluse Gotama is teaching the Dharma to an assembly of a few hundred, there is neither the sound of coughing nor of clearing the throat amongst the recluse Gotama’s disciples,

A great crowd of people waiting for him would be eagerly ready, thinking,⁵⁸

“Let us listen to our Blessed One who will be teaching the Dharma!”

21 Just as a man at a crossroads were to press out a little honey,⁵⁹ so, too, the great crowd would be eagerly ready.

21.2 Even so, *when the recluse Gotama is teaching the Dharma to an assembly of a few hundred, there is neither the sound of coughing or of clearing the throat amongst the recluse Gotama’s disciples.*

A great crowd of people waiting for him would be eagerly ready, thinking, “Let us listen to our Blessed One who will be teaching the Dharma!”

22 Even those disciples of the recluse Gotama who, having fallen out with their fellow brahmacharis, give up the training and returned to the low life,⁶⁰

they still speak in praise of the teacher, speak in praise of the Dharma, and speak in praise of the sangha.

23 They blame only themselves, without blaming others, saying,

“We’re just unfortunate, we’re of little merit. Although we have gone forth in the well-taught Dharma-Vinaya, we were unable to live the holy life that is fully pure.

24 They, having become park attendants or lay-followers, continue to undertake the 5 precepts as training-rules.⁶¹

25 Thus, the recluse Gotama *is* revered, respected, esteemed, honoured by his disciples, and the disciples, having honoured and respected the recluse Gotama, dwell in dependence on him.”⁶²

SAKUL’UDĀYI’S 5 QUALITIES

The 5 qualities Sakul’udāyi sees in the Buddha

26 “**Udāyi, how many qualities** do you see in me, on account of which my disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour me,

and, having honoured and respected me, they dwell in dependence on me?”⁶³

27 “Bhante, I see **5 qualities** in the Blessed One, *on account of which the Blessed One’s disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour him,*

⁵⁷ “Cleared his throat,” *ukkāsi*, aor of *ukkāsati*, “to cough, clear one’s throat (esp to announce one’s arrival or presence) (V 1:248,2 = D 1:89,30 = M 2:119,25 = A 5:65,19; V 2:160,32 ≈ J 1:161,27; V 2:222,8, 4:150,34; M 2:4,35). See also CPD: *ukkāsita* (n) [§20]

⁵⁸ *Tam enaṃ mahā,jana,kāyo paccāsim samāna,rūpo* (so Ce Ee Ke Se; Be *paccāsīsamāna,rūpo*) *paccupaṭṭhito hoti.*

⁵⁹ *Seyyathāpi nāma puriso cātummahāpathe khuddaṃ madhuṃ* (so Ce Ee Ke Se; Be *khudda,madhuṃ*) *anelakaṃ pīleyya* [Ce *uppīleyya*].

⁶⁰ *Ye’pi samaṇassa gotamassa sāvakā sa,brahma,cārīhi sampayojetvā sikkhaṃ paccakkhāya hīnāyāvattanti.*

⁶¹ *Te ārāmika,bhūtā vā upāsaka,bhūtā vā pañca,sikkhāpade samādāya vattanti.*

⁶² Sakul’udāyi’s opening report which starts at **§8** (where see n), ends here [**§25**]. This is perhaps the longest speech that a non-Buddhist has made to the Buddha. [2.1]

⁶³ *Kati pana tvaṃ udāyi mayi dhamme samanupassasi, yehi mama* [Be *mamaṃ*] *sāvakā sakkaronti garu,karonti* [so Ce Ee Ke Se; Be *garuṃ karonti*] *mānenti pūjenti, sakkatvā garuṃ katvā upanissāya viharantīti.*

and, having honoured and respected the Blessed One, they dwell in dependence on him.

28 What are the five?

(1) Bhante, **the Blessed One takes little food, and speaks in praise of taking little food.**⁶⁴

Bhante, that *the Blessed One takes little food, and speaks in praise of taking little food*—this, bhante, is the first quality that I see in the Blessed One,

on account of which the Blessed One’s disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour him, and, having honoured and respected the Blessed One, they dwell in dependence on him. [6]

(2) Furthermore, bhante, **the Blessed One is contented with any kind of robe, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of robe.**

Bhante, that *the Blessed One is contented with any kind of robe, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of robe*—this, bhante, is the second quality that I see in the Blessed One,

on account of which the Blessed One’s disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour him, and, having honoured and respected the Blessed One, they dwell in dependence on him.

(3) Furthermore, bhante, **the Blessed One is contented with any kind of almsfood, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of almsfood.**

Bhante, that *the Blessed One is contented with any kind of almsfood, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of almsfood*—this, bhante, is the third quality that I see in the Blessed One,

on account of which the Blessed One’s disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour him, and, having honoured and respected the Blessed One, they dwell in dependence on him.

(4) Furthermore, bhante, **the Blessed One is contented with any kind of lodging, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of lodging.**

Bhante, that *the Blessed One is contented with any kind of lodging, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of lodging*—this, bhante, is the fourth quality that I see in the Blessed One,

on account of which the Blessed One’s disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour him, and, having honoured and respected the Blessed One, they dwell in dependence on him.

(5) Furthermore, bhante, **the Blessed One is solitary, and speaks in praise of solitude.**⁶⁵

Bhante, that *the Blessed One is solitary, and speaks in praise of solitude*—this, bhante, is the fifth quality that I see in the Blessed One,

on account of which the Blessed One’s disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour him, and, having honoured and respected the Blessed One, they dwell in dependence on him.

28.2 These, bhante, are the 5 qualities that I see in the Blessed One, *on account of which the Blessed One’s disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour him,*

and, having honoured and respected the Blessed One, they dwell in dependence on him.”

The Buddha’s response to Sakul’udāyi

29 (1) “Suppose, Udāyi,⁶⁶ on account of the fact that ‘**the recluse Gotama takes little food, and speaks in praise of taking little food**’ *my disciples were to revere, respect, esteem, honour me,*

*and, having honoured and respected me, they dwell in dependence on me.*⁶⁷

29.2 But, Udāyi, there are disciples of mine who take only a cupful, or only half a cup, or a bilva fruit, or half a bilva fruit.⁶⁸ [7]

⁶⁴ *Bhagavā hi bhante app’āhāro, app’āhāratāya ca vaṇṇa, vādī.* Note here—and throughout Sakul’udāyi’s speech—he addresses the Buddha politely as *bhagavā*. However, cf that, the Buddha, in response to Sakul’udāyi’s 5 points [§§29 etc], quoting him, addresses himself in the 3rd person as “the recluse Gotama” throughout. In this way, the Buddha clearly is considering the other non-Buddhists in the audience—and to non-Buddhists today—who think highly of the Buddha, whether for the wrong reasons and the right ones.

⁶⁵ *Puna ca’param bhante bhagavā pavivitto, pavivekassa ca vaṇṇa, vādī.*

⁶⁶ The Buddha’s full instruction to Sakul’udāyi begins here and continues right to the end of the Sutta at §61.

⁶⁷ “Suppose ... my disciples ... dwell in dependence on me,” *iti ce maṃ udāyi sāvakā sakkareyyuṃ garuṃ kareyyuṃ māneyyuṃ pūjeyyuṃ, sakkatvā garuṃ katvā upanissāya vihareyyuṃ.* Note the stress here is on “me” (*maṃ*), the Buddha, as the object of every action here. Cf §39.3 (the refrain) and the rest of the Sutta.

29.3 But I, Udāyi, sometimes eat a bowlful filled to the brim, or even more.⁶⁹

29.4 So, if, Udāyi, on account of the fact that ‘the recluse Gotama takes little food, and speaks in praise of taking little food,’ *my disciples were to revere, respect, esteem, honour me, and, having honoured and respected me, and dwell in dependence on me—*

29.5 but, then, Udāyi, those disciples who take only a cupful, or only half a cup, or a bilva fruit, or half a bilva fruit should not revere, respect, esteem, honour me, and, having neither honoured nor respected me, they should not dwell in dependence on me!

30 (2) Suppose, Udāyi, on account of the fact that ‘**the recluse Gotama is contented with any kind of robe, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of robe**’ *my disciples were to revere, respect, esteem, honour me, and, having honoured and respected me, they dwell in dependence on me.*

30.2 But, Udāyi, there are disciples of mine who wear dust-heap-ropes, wear coarse robes, who collect rags from the charnel-grounds or refuse-dumps or shops, and making an upper robe of them, wear them.⁷⁰

30.3 But I, Udāyi, sometimes wear robes given by householders⁷¹ that are hardy, rough and hairy like the bottle-gourd.⁷²

30.4 So, if, Udāyi, on account of the fact that ‘the recluse Gotama is contented with any kind of robe, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of robe,’ *my disciples were to revere, respect, esteem, honour me, and, having honoured and respected me, and dwell in dependence on me—*

30.5 but, then, Udāyi, those disciples who wear dust-heap-ropes, wear coarse robes, who collect rags from the charnel ground or refuse-dumps or shops, and making an upper robe of them, wear them should not revere, respect, esteem, honour me, and, having neither honoured nor respected me, they should not dwell in dependence on me!

31 (3) Suppose, Udāyi, on account of the fact that ‘**the recluse Gotama is contented with any kind of almsfood, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of almsfood**’ *my disciples were to revere, respect, esteem, honour me, and, having honoured and respected me, they dwell in dependence on me.*

31.2 But, Udāyi, there are disciples of mine who are almsfood-eaters, who walk the unbroken alms-round from house to house, who delight in the rounds of food-gleanings;⁷³ having entered amongst houses [an inhabited area], they will not consent to sitting down, even when invited.⁷⁴

⁶⁸ *Santi kho pana me udāyi sāvakaṃ kosak’āhārā’pi aḍḍha, kosak’āhārā’pi beluv’āhārā’pi aḍḍha, beluv’āhārā’pi. A “bilva” or “vilva” (beluva or belva) (M 1:108, 2:6; J 4:363, 368, 6:525, 560) is the Aegle marmelos (PED). It is also known as Bengal quince, stone apple or wood apple, is native to India but found throughout south and SE Asia, and also the Philippines. It is a hardy mid-sized, slender, aromatic, armed, gum-bearing tree growing up to 18 m tall. Its fruit is large and hard. See **Madhu, piṇḍika S** (M 18,2.2), SD 6.14; **Aṭṭhaka, nāgara S** (M 52,1), SD 41.2; **Daddabha J** (J 322).*

⁶⁹ *Ahaṃ kho pana udāyi app’ekadā iminā pattena samatittikaṃ pi bhuñjāmi, bhiyyo’pi bhuñjāmi.*

⁷⁰ *Santi kho pana me udāyi sāvakaṃ paṃsu, kūlikā lūkhā, cīvara, dharā, te susānā vā saṅkāra, kūṭā vā pāpaṇikā vā nantakāni [Ce pāpaṇikāni vā nantakāni vā] uccinitvā [Be:Ka ucchinditvā] saṅghāṭim karitvā dhārenti.*

⁷¹ Cf **Bakkula S** (M 124), where the elder Bakkula declares, “In those 80 years, avuso Kassapa, since I went forth, I do not recall ever having accepted a robe from a householder...” (M 124,9), SD 3.15.

⁷² *Ahaṃ kho pan’udāyi app’ekadā gahapati, cīvarāni dhāremi dalhāni yattha lūkhāni alābu, lomasāni. Be sattha, -lūkhāni; Ce sutta, lūkhāni alāvu, lomasāni. Se MA 1:109. The young fruit of the bottle gourd or calabash (alābum alāvu, lābu, etc), Lagenaria vulgaris, is densely hairy, but are ultimately glabrous (smooth when mature).*

⁷³ “Food-gleaning,” *unchāsaka*, a rare application here. A late (often comy) term, rare in sutta context (cf A 1:36, -27, 3:66,7, 67,1, 104,11 ≈ V 1:238,11, 3:6,19; Thī 329 ≈ 349 (ThīA 235,1 “scraps of food obtained from house-to-house almsround”; 242,13: “gleanings”) see PTC: uñcha); often in ref to brahminical ascetics, hermits and forest-dwellers, esp in Jātakas (eg J 5:323,17* = 6:532,15* = 569,4*): see CPD: uñcha.

⁷⁴ *Santi kho pana me udāyi sāvakaṃ piṇḍa, pātikā sa, padāna, cārino uñchāsake vate ratā, te antara, gharaṃ pavitthā samānā āsanena’pi nimantiyamānā na sādīyanti.* Such ascetic practices (*dhutaṅga*) seem to become more common in later sutta times: see eg **Bakkula S** (M 124), SD 3.15.

31.3 But I, Udāyi, sometimes eat invitation meals of rice free of black specks, [8] and various sauces and curries.⁷⁵

31.4 So, if, Udāyi, on account of the fact that ‘the recluse Gotama is contented with any kind of almsfood, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of almsfood,’ *my disciples were to revere, respect, esteem, honour me, and, having honoured and respected me, and dwell in dependence on me—*

31.5 but, then, Udāyi, those disciples who are almsfood-eaters, who walk the unbroken alms-round from house to house, who delight in the rounds of food-gleanings; having entered amongst houses [an inhabited area], they will not consent to sitting down, even when invited should not revere, respect, esteem, honour me,

and, having neither honoured nor respected me, they should not dwell in dependence on me!

32 (4) Suppose, Udāyi, on account of the fact that ‘**the recluse Gotama is contented with any kind of lodging, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of lodging**’ *my disciples were to revere, respect, esteem, honour me,*

and, having honoured and respected me, they dwell in dependence on me.

32.2 But, Udāyi, there are disciples of mine who are tree-foot dwellers, open-air dwellers, who are without roof for 8 months (of the year).⁷⁶

32.3 But I, Udāyi, sometimes dwell in an upper chamber [a belvedere],⁷⁷ with walls plastered within and without, protected from the wind, with bolted doors⁷⁸ and shuttered windows,⁷⁹

32.4 So, if, Udāyi, on account of the fact that ‘the recluse Gotama is contented with any kind of lodging, and speaks in praise of contentment with any kind of lodging,’ *my disciples were to revere, respect, esteem, honour me, and, having honoured and respected me, and dwell in dependence on me—*

32.5 but, then, Udāyi, those disciples who are tree-foot dwellers, open-air dwellers, who are without roof for 8 months (of the year) should not revere, respect, esteem, honour me,

and, having neither honoured nor respected me, they should not dwell in dependence on me!

33 (5) Suppose, Udāyi, on account of the fact that ‘**the recluse Gotama is solitary, and speaks in praise of solitude**⁸⁰ *my disciples were to revere, respect, esteem, honour me,*

⁷⁵ *Ahaṃ kho pan ’udāyi app ’ekadā nimantane ’pi [Ce pāpaṇikāni vā nantakāni vā] bhuñjāmi sālīnaṃ odanaṃ vici-ta,kālakam aneka,sūpaṃ aneka,vyañjanam.* This “speck-free rice-meal pericope” recurs in **Ambaṭṭha S** (D 30,2.10.-1/1:105), SD 21.3; **Anaṅgaṇa S** (M 5,30.3/1:31), SD 37.7; **Vatthūpama S** (M 7,12.1/1:39×2), SD 28.12; **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77,31.3/2:8), SD 49.5a.

⁷⁶ *Santi kho pana me udāyi sāvakā rukkha,mūlikā abbh ’okāsikā, te aṭṭha,māse channaṃ na upenti.* Those “without roof for 8 months” (*aṭṭha,māse channaṃ na upenti*) are renunciants who live itinerant open-air lives.

⁷⁷ *Ahaṃ kho pan ’udāyi app ’ekadā kūṭ ’āgāresu ’pi viharāmi ullitā ’valittesu nivātesu phussit ’aggaḷesu [Be phusit ’-aggaḷesu] pihita,vāta,pānesu.* The brief mansion pericope: as 1st para of in **Anuruddha Mahā,vitakka S** (A 8.30,-10.2/4:230), SD 19.5. The “fuller mansion pericope” recurs at **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,41/1:76) n, SD 49.1; and the “fullest mansion pericope” at (**Hatthaka**) **Āḷavaka S** (A 3.34,7/1:137), SD 4.8. The fuller mansion pericope: “A mansion ... an upper chamber etc ... ,” (sg) *pāsādo ... kūṭāgāraṃ ullitāvalittam nivātam phusit ’aggaḷam pihita,-vāta,pānam:* recurs as the “fullest mansion pericope” (with additional para) at **Hatthaka Āḷavaka S** (A 3.34,7/-1:137), SD 4.8. Comy glosses it as a “long house” (*pāsāda*) an elongated mansion (MA 2:39 = VA 654; see V:H 2:16 n5; see AA 2:168). *Kūṭāgāra* here refers to an upper chamber. See also A 3.34/1:137; A 8.30,10/4:231; (pl) *kūṭ ’āgārāni pi... ullitāvalittāni nivātāni phusit ’aggaḷāni pihita,vāta.pānāni* (M 115,2/3:61; A 3.1/1:101); loc *kūṭ ’-āgāresu... ullitāvalittesu nivātesu phusit ’aggaḷesu pihita,vātapānesu* (M 77,9/2:8). On *ullitāvalitta* in ref to a residence (*vihāra*), see V 3:156, 4:47; a hut (*kūṭi*), see V 3:149. Ways of adorning windows (*vāta,pānā*) are given at V 4:47; also V 2:148; on doors, see Cv 5.14.5 (V 2:121), 6.2.2 (V 2:148); V 4:47. Cf this description at **Bahu,dhātuka S** (M 115,2.2/3:61), SD 29.1a = (**Tika**) **Bhaya S** (A 3.1/1:101; where also see the parable of the burning gabled houses (*aggi,mukko* [vl ~*mutto*] *kūṭāgārāni pi dahati*). The “brief mansion pericope” [§41.3] re-curs in **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77,32.3), SD 49.5a.

⁷⁸ “With bolted doors,” *phussit ’aggaḷam* (M 3:61; A 1:101, 137): see **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,41.3), SD 49.1.

⁷⁹ For details on this “brief mansion pericope,” see **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,41.3), SD 49.1.

⁸⁰ *Pavivitto samaṇo gotamo, pavivekassa ca vaṇṇa,vādī ’ti.* Also at (**Kassapa**) **Ovāda S 2** (S 16.8/2:209 ×2), SD 88.5. Cf **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,45/1:77), SD 49.1; **Ratha Vinīta S** (M 24,2/1:145), SD 28.3; **Mahā Go,singa S** (M 32,7/1:214+14/1:217+14/1:218), SD 44.12; **Dasa,bala S 2** (S 12.22/2:29), “solitude from bad unwholesome

and, having honoured and respected me, they dwell in dependence on me.

33.2 But, Udāyi, there are disciples of mine who are forest-dwellers, dwelling in remote lodgings, who live secluded in remote jungle thickets, entering the midst of the sangha only every half-month for the recitation of the Pātimokkha [monastic code].⁸¹

33.3 But I, Udāyi, sometimes dwell surrounded by monks, nuns, laymen, laywomen, kings, royal ministers, other sectarians, the disciples of sectarians.⁸²

33.4 So, if, Udāyi, on account of the fact that ‘the recluse Gotama is solitary, and speaks in praise of solitude,’ [9] *my disciples were to revere, respect, esteem, honour me, and, having honoured and respected me, and dwell in dependence on me—*

33.5 but, then, Udāyi, those disciples who are forest-dwellers, dwelling in remote lodgings, who live withdrawn in remote jungle thickets, entering the midst of the sangha only every half-month for the recitation of the Pātimokkha should not revere, respect, esteem, honour me,

and, having neither honoured nor respected me, they should not dwell in dependence on me!

THE BUDDHA’S 5 QUALITIES

The real reasons for honouring the Buddha

34 But, Udāyi, it is not on account of these 5 qualities that my disciples *revere, respect, esteem, honour me,*

and, having honoured and respected, they dwell in dependence.

35 There are, Udāyi, another 5 qualities. On account of these 5 qualities, my disciples *revere, respect, esteem, honour me,*

and, having honoured and respected, they dwell in dependence.

What are the five?

1. THE HIGHER MORAL VIRTUE

(*adhisīla*)

36 Here, Udāyi, my disciples esteem **higher moral virtue**, thinking,

‘The recluse Gotama is morally virtuous, accomplished with the supreme aggregate of moral virtue.’⁸³

36.2 It is this higher moral virtue, Udāyi, that my disciples esteem, thinking,

‘*The recluse Gotama is morally virtuous, accomplished with the supreme aggregate of moral virtue.*’

states.” On the solitude of other monks, see **Anuruddha Mahā, vitakka S** (A 8.30, 1.3/4:233), SD 19.5; **Kathā, vatthu S 2** (A 10.70/5:130), SD 103.5; **Piṇḍola S** (U 4.6/42), SD 27.6a; (**Udāna**) **Sāriputta S 2** (U 4.7/43), SD 109.1; of Mahā Kassapa, (**Kassapa**) **Jiṇṇa S** (S 16.5/2:202 f×4), SD 96.10; also **Tha 581** (Upasena Vaṅganta,putta).

⁸¹ *Santi kho pana me udāyi sāvaka ārañṇikā panta, senāsana ārañṇa, vana, patthāni pantāni sen’āsanāni ajjhogā-hetvā viharanti, te anvadha, māsaṃ saṅgha, majjhe osaranti pātimokkh’uddesāya.* Such a solitary dwelling is one of the optional 13 ascetic practices (*dhut’āṅga*): **Bakkula S** (M 124) & SD 3.15 (2). On “extra gains” (*atireka, lābha*), see **Anaṅgaṇa S** (M 5), SD 37.7 (3.2); **Anubuddha S** (S 47.3), SD 24.6a (2.3.1(2)).

⁸² *Ahaṃ kho pan’udāyi app’ekadā ākiṇṇo viharāmi bhikkhūhi bhikkhunīhi upāsakehi upāsikāhi rañṇā rāja, mahāmattehi titthiyehi titthiya, sāvakehi.* Although the Buddha may associate with such people, he is always mindful, and does not really “socialize” as the laity or wayward monastics would. In **Mahā Suññata S** (M 122) and **Anuruddha Mahā, vitakka S** (A 8.30), the Buddha says that he dwells “abiding in emptiness within,” ie, at peace, joyfully free from any craving, and when visited by others, he would only admonish and inspire them into wholesome action, and then dismiss them (M 124, 6.2), SD 11.4 ≈ (A 8.30, 20-21) + SD 19.5 (3).

⁸³ *Idh’udāyi mamaṃ sāvaka adhisīle sambhāventi, ’sīlavā samaṇo gotamo paramena sīla-k, khandhena samannā-gato’ti.* The Buddha is often quoted as saying that he is one who is both true to his word and in his action: “As he speaks, so he acts; as he acts, so he speaks” (*yathā, vādī ... tathāgato tathā, kārī yathā, kārī tathā, vādī*): **Mahā Govinda S** (D 19, 11+26), SD 63.4; **Pāsādika S** (D 29, 29.3), SD 40a.6; (**Tathāgata**) **Loka S** (A 4.23, 2) = (It 112/122, 2), SD 15.7(2); **Nigrodha, kappa S** (only first phrase, Sn 24/357a*/62), SD 80.6 = J 326/104*; Nc:Be 169. In this way, too, he is said to be endowed with both “knowledge and conduct” (*vijjā, caraṇa, sampanna*): SD 15.7(2) (3.3).

36.3 This, Udāyī, is **the first quality** that my disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour, and, having honoured and respected, they dwell in dependence.⁸⁴

2. KNOWLEDGE AND VISION (*ñāṇa, dassana*)

37 Furthermore, Udāyī, my disciples esteem the surpassing **knowledge and vision**, thinking,⁸⁵

‘Truly knowing, the recluse Gotama says, “I know”; truly seeing, the recluse Gotama says, “I see.”⁸⁶

The recluse Gotama teaches the Dharma based on direct knowledge, not without direct knowledge.

The recluse Gotama teaches the Dharma with proper cause, not without proper cause.

The recluse Gotama teaches the Dharma with wonders, not without wonders.

37.2 It is this surpassing knowledge and vision that my disciples esteem, thus:

‘Truly knowing, the recluse Gotama says, “I know”; truly seeing, the recluse Gotama says, “I see.”

The recluse Gotama teaches the Dharma based on direct knowledge, not without direct knowledge.

The recluse Gotama teaches the Dharma with proper cause, not without proper cause.

The recluse Gotama teaches the Dharma with wonders, not without wonders.

37.3 This, Udāyī, is **the second quality** that my [10] disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour, and, having honoured and respected, they dwell in dependence.

3. HIGHER WISDOM (*adhipaññā*)

38 Furthermore, Udāyī, my disciples esteem **higher wisdom**, thinking,

‘The recluse Gotama is wise, accomplished in the supreme aggregate of wisdom.’

38.2 It is impossible that he is unable to see an unarisen⁸⁷ argument, or to refute, by reasonable means of the Dharma, an outside teaching that has arisen, and teach the Dharma in all its wonder.⁸⁸

38.3 What do you think, Udāyī, would my disciples, knowing thus, seeing thus, interrupt an ongoing discussion?⁸⁹

“No, bhante.”

38.4 “Indeed, Udāyī, it is not I who expect instruction from disciples; in all certainty, it is my disciples who expect instruction from me.

38.5 It is impossible, Udāyī, that my disciples who esteem higher wisdom would think:

⁸⁴ *Ayaṃ kho udāyī paṭhamo dhammo, yena mamaṃ sāvakaṃ sakkaronti garuṃ karonti mānenti pūjenti, sakkatvā garuṃ katvā upanissāya viharanti.* Note that here the emphasis is on the Dharma, not the Buddha: cf the parallel sentence at §29.1 etc, where *mam* (“me”) while here it is *mamaṃ* (“my”), that is “my disciples.” This important change is not reflected in the M:B translation, which reads “my disciples honour me ...” (emphases added) throughout.

⁸⁵ This and the foll sentence: *Puna ca ’paraṃ udāyī mamaṃ sāvakaṃ abhikkante ñāṇa, dassane sambhāventi, ’jānaṃ yev’āha samaṇo gotamo ’jānāmīti, passaṃ yev’āha samaṇo gotamo ’passāmīti,*

⁸⁶ The following 3 qualities are also at **Gotamaka Cetiya S** (A 3.123,3/1:276), SD 11.10.

⁸⁷ “Unarisen,” *anāgata*, “future”; Comy: it means “yet to come; future” (*āgamanaka*); opp is “arisen” (*uppanna*) (MA 3:241). The phrase “unarisen argument” then means “unforeseen implication” or “possible significance.” In other words, the Buddha is circumspect regarding all aspects of an issue or argument.

⁸⁸ *Taṃ vata anāgataṃ vāda, pathaṃ na dakkhati, uppannaṃ vā para-p, pavādaṃ na saha, dhammena suniggahitaṃ nigganhiṣṣatīti n’etaṃ thānaṃ vijjati.* This whole sentence is given in more detail in Māra’s invitation in **Mahā-parinibbāna S** (D 16,3.7.3-3.7.5 etc), SD 9; **Bhūmi, cāla S** (A 8.70/4:311). The last half of this sentence, with a similar sense, recurs as “until they shall be able, by reasonable means of the Dharma, to refute outside views that have arisen, and teach the Dharma in all its wonder” (*uppannaṃ para-p, pavādaṃ saha dhammena suniggahitaṃ niggaḥetvā sappāṭihāriyaṃ dhammaṃ desessantīti*). Ironically, these words are spoken by Māra. The “**outside views**” (*para-p, pavāda*) are the 62 bases for wrong views: see **Cūḷa Siha, nāda S** (M 11,2.2) n. SD 49.2.

⁸⁹ *Taṃ kiṃ maññasi udāyī api nu me sāvakaṃ evaṃ jānantā evaṃ passantā antar’antarā, kathaṃ opāteyyun’ti.*

‘The recluse Gotama is wise, accomplished in the supreme aggregate of wisdom; but, he is unable to see an unarisen argument, or to refute, by reasonable means of the Dharma, an outside teaching that has arisen, and teach the Dharma in all its wonder.’⁹⁰

38.6 This, Udāyi, is **the third quality** that my disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour, and, having honoured and respected, they dwell in dependence.

4. THE 4 NOBLE TRUTHS (*catu ariya,sacca*)

39 Furthermore, Udāyi, those disciples of mine who have suffered, affected by suffering, overcome by suffering, have approached me and

(1) asked about the noble truth that is suffering.⁹¹

When asked about *the noble truth that is suffering*,

I answered them; I satisfied their hearts by answering the question.

(2) They asked me about the noble truth that is the arising of suffering.

When asked about *the noble truth that is the arising of suffering*,

I answered them; I satisfied their hearts by answering the question.

(3) They asked me about the noble truth that is the ending of suffering.

When asked about *the noble truth that is the ending of suffering*,

I answered them; I satisfied their hearts by answering the question.

(4) They asked me about the noble truth that is the way leading to the ending of suffering.

When asked about *the noble truth that is the way leading to the ending of suffering*,

I answered them; I satisfied their hearts by answering the question.

40 Udāyi, that these disciples of mine who have suffered, affected by suffering, overcome by suffering, have approached me

- and asked about the noble truth that is suffering:

when asked about *the noble truth that is suffering*, I answered them; I satisfied their hearts by answering the question;

- they asked me about the noble truth that is the arising of suffering:

when asked about *the noble truth that is the arising of suffering*, I answered them; I satisfied their hearts by answering the question;

- they asked me about the noble truth that is the ending of suffering.

when asked about *the noble truth that is the ending of suffering*, I answered them; I satisfied their hearts by answering the question;

- they asked me about the noble truth that is the way leading to the ending of suffering.

when asked about *the noble truth that is the way leading to the ending of suffering*, I answered them; I satisfied their hearts by answering the question—

40.2 this, Udāyi, is **the fourth quality [11]** that my disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour, and, having honoured and respected, they dwell in dependence.

⁹⁰ This section is missing from M:ÑB ad loc.

⁹¹ *Puna ca 'param udāyi mama sāvaka yena dukkhena dukkh'otiṇṇā dukkha,paretā, te maṃ upasaṅkamitvā dukkham ariya,saccam pucchanti.* The rest of these sections are abbreviated in the text, but given in full here.

5. THE PATH TO AWAKENING⁹²(1) The 4 focuses of mindfulness

41 Furthermore, Udāyī, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would cultivate **the 4 focuses of mindfulness**.⁹³

41.2 Here, Udāyī, a monk

(1) dwells⁹⁴ exertive, clearly aware, mindful,
contemplating the body in the body,⁹⁵ *kāye kāyānupassī*
removing⁹⁶ covetousness and displeasure⁹⁷ in regard to the world.⁹⁸

(2) He dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful,
contemplating feelings in the feelings, *vedanāsu vedanā'nupassī*
removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world.

(3) He dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful,
contemplating the mind in the mind, *citte cittānupassī*
removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world.

(4) He dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful,
contemplating dharmas in the dharmas, *dhammesu dhammānupassī*
removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world.

41.3 And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.⁹⁹

(2) The 4 right strivings

42 Furthermore, Udāyī, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would cultivate **the 4 right strivings**.¹⁰⁰

⁹² Sets nos 1-10 here [§§44-53] recur mutatis mutandis in **Jhāna Vagga** of Aṅguttara (A 1.20,10-72/1:39-41). Set 11 (the 4 dhyanas) appears at the start of the Aṅguttara list, along with the 4 divine abodes, which is omitted from the Sutta list (A 1.20.2-9). See Intro (2.2.1).

⁹³ “The 4 focuses of mindfulness,” *catu satipaṭṭhāna*: see SD 13.

⁹⁴ *Ātāpī sampajāno satimā, vineyya loke abhijjhā,domanassaṃ*. Here we find 4 of the 5 spiritual faculties (*pañc'indriya*) in action: see SD 13.1 (4.2).

⁹⁵ “Contemplating the body in the body” (*kāye kāyānupassī*). See SD 13.1 (3.4).

⁹⁶ *Vineyya* can mean “should remove” (as pot, like *vineyya*, Sn 590) or as “having removed” (as ger, like *vinayitvā*, Pm 1:244), and both senses apply in Satipaṭṭhāna S. U Silananda similarly ends the sentence with “removing covetousness and grief in the world” (1990:177); also 1990:22-25. See SD 13.1 (4.2c) above.

⁹⁷ “Covetousness and displeasure [discontent],” *abhijjhā,domanassaṃ*, alt trs: “desire and discontent,” “desiring and disliking,” or “longing and loathing.” Walshe (1995:335 & n632) renders it as “hankering and fretting [in regard to the world].” See SD 13.1 (4.2).

⁹⁸ “World” (*loka*). See SD 13.1 (4.2.4).

⁹⁹ *Tatra ca pana me sāvakā bahū abhiññā,vosāna,pārami-p,pattā viharanti*. The phrase “having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge” (*abhiññā,vosāna,pārami-p,pattā*) occurs a total of 19 times here, ie, at the end of each of the 19 sections constituting the “5th” quality for which disciples respect the Buddha. Comy equates it with the attaining of arhathood (MA 3:243). The term recurs only once, viz, at **Ananussuta S** (A 5.11), where it refers to the 5 powers (those of faith, moral shame, moral fear, effort, and wisdom, ie, respectively *saddhā,-bāla, hiri,bala, ottappa,bala, viriya,bala* and *paññā,bala*) (A 5.11/3:9,15), SD 10.5(3); its Comy explains *abhiññā,-vosāna,pārami-p,patta* as follows “**I claim to have gained accomplishment and perfection**” means that he [the Buddha] shows the virtues he has himself arrived at, sitting cross-legged, under the great bodhi, thus, ‘On account of having completed the work of the sixteenfold tasks of the 4 truths [3.3], with the realization of the 4 paths [3.3], having accomplished all my tasks, attained supremacy, I claim to have attained the beyond [nirvana].’” (*catūsu saccesu catūhi maggehi soḷasa,vidhassa kiccassa karaṇena abhijānitvā vosāna,pāramiṃ sabbesaṃ kiccānaṃ niṭṭhitatā kata,kicca,bhāvaṃ pāraṃ patto paṭijānāmīti mahā,bodhi,pallanke attano āgamaṇīya,guṇaṃ dasseti*, AA 3:225).

¹⁰⁰ “The 4 right strivings,” *catu samma-p,padhāna*, or 4 right efforts: see **(Catu) Padhāna S** (D 3,1.11 = A 4.14), SD 10.2.

42.2 Here, Udāyi, a monk

- (1) brings forth desire for the restraint of unarisen bad unwholesome states. *saṃvara*
He makes an effort, rouses energy, applies his mind and strives.
- (2) He brings forth desire for the abandoning of arisen bad unwholesome states. *pahāna*
He makes an effort, rouses energy, applies his mind and strives.
- (3) He brings forth desire for the cultivating of unarisen wholesome states. *bhāvanā*
He makes an effort, rouses energy, applies his mind and strives.
- (4) He brings forth desire for the guarding [maintenance] of arisen wholesome states. *anurakkhana*
He makes an effort, rouses energy, applies his mind and strives.

42.3 These, bhikshus, are the 4 right strivings.¹⁰¹

42.4 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(3) The 4 paths of spiritual power

43 Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would cultivate **the 4 paths of spiritual power**.¹⁰²

43.2 Here, Udāyi, a monk

- (1) cultivates¹⁰³ the basis for spiritual success
that is accomplished in concentration due to enthusiasm¹⁰⁴ *chanda*
and the forces of exertion.¹⁰⁵
- (2) He cultivates the basis for spiritual success
that is accomplished in concentration due to effort *virīya*
and the forces of exertion.¹⁰⁶
- (3) He cultivates the basis for spiritual success
that is accomplished in concentration due to mind *citta*
and the forces of exertion.
- (4) He cultivates the basis for spiritual success
that is accomplished in concentration due to investigation *vīmaṃsā*
and the forces of exertion.

43.3 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(4) The 5 spiritual faculties

44 Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would cultivate **the 5 spiritual faculties**.¹⁰⁷ [12]

44.2 Here, Udāyi, a monk

- (1) cultivates the faculty of faith, leading to peace, leading to self-awakening; *saddh'indriya*
- (2) cultivates the faculty of effort, leading to peace, leading to self-awakening; *viriy'indriya*
- (3) cultivates the faculty of mindfulness, leading to peace, leading to self-awakening; *sat'indriya*

¹⁰¹ D 3:221; M 2:11; S 5:244; A 4.13/2:15, 4.14/2:16 f, 4.69/2:74; Vbh 208; cf A 4.14/2:16 f.

¹⁰² “The 4 paths of spiritual power,” *catu iddhi,pāda*: see **Catu Iddhi,pāda**, SD 10.3.

¹⁰³ From here to the end: *chanda.samādhi,padhāna,sāṅkhāra,samannāgataṃ*.

¹⁰⁴ “Concentration due to enthusiasm,” *chanda,samādhi*. See foll n & SD 10.3 Intro.

¹⁰⁵ “The forces of exertion,” *padhāna,sāṅkhārā*. The whole phrase is *chanda,samādhi,padhāna,sāṅkhāra,samannāgataṃ*. See prev n & SD 10.3 Intro.

¹⁰⁶ On the repetition of “effort” here, see SD 10.3 (2).

¹⁰⁷ “The 5 spiritual faculties,” *pañc'indriya*, or simply, “the 5 faculties”: see **Pañc'indriya**, SD 10.4. The passage below recurs in **Sampanna S** (S 48.19/5:202 f), SD 10.4(4.5), and is elaborated in **Indriya Sampanna Sutta** (S 35.-154), SD 10.4(4.6).

- (4) cultivates the faculty of concentration, leading to peace, leading to self-awakening; *samādh'indriya*
 (5) cultivates the faculty of wisdom, leading to peace, leading to self-awakening. *paññ'indriya*
 44.3 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(5) The 5 spiritual powers

45 Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would cultivate **the 5 spiritual powers**.¹⁰⁸

45.2 Here, Udāyi, a monk

- (1) cultivates the power of faith, leading to peace, leading to self-awakening; *saddhā bala*
 (2) cultivates the power of effort, leading to peace, leading to self-awakening; *virīya bala*
 (3) cultivates the power of mindfulness, leading to peace, leading to self-awakening; *sati bala*
 (4) cultivates the power of concentration, leading to peace, leading to self-awakening; *samādhi bala*
 (5) cultivates the power of wisdom, leading to peace, leading to self-awakening. *paññā bala*

45.3 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(6) The 7 awakening-factors

46 Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would cultivate **the 7 awakening-factors**.¹⁰⁹

46.2 Here, Udāyi, a monk

- (1) cultivates the awakening-factor that is mindfulness, *sati*
 that is dependent on solitude,
 dependent on fading away (of lust) [on dispassion],
 dependent on cessation (of suffering),
 ripening in letting go (of defilements).¹¹⁰
- (2) He cultivates the awakening-factor that is dharma-investigation, *dhamma, vicaya*
that is dependent on solitude,
dependent on fading away (of lust) [on dispassion],
dependent on cessation (of suffering),
ripening in letting go (of defilements).
- (3) He cultivates the awakening-factor that is effort, *virīya*
that is dependent on solitude,
dependent on fading away (of lust) [on dispassion],
dependent on cessation (of suffering),
ripening in letting go (of defilements).
- (4) He cultivates the awakening-factor that is zest, *pīti*
that is dependent on solitude,
dependent on fading away (of lust) [on dispassion],
dependent on cessation (of suffering),
ripening in letting go (of defilements).
- (5) He cultivates the awakening-factor that is tranquillity, *passaddhi*
that is dependent on solitude,
dependent on fading away (of lust) [on dispassion],
dependent on cessation (of suffering),

¹⁰⁸ “The 5 spiritual powers,” *pañca bala*, or simply, “the 5 powers”: see *Pañca bala*, SD 10.5.

¹⁰⁹ See **(Bojjhaṅga) Sīla S** (S 46.3), SD 10.15.

¹¹⁰ The prec 4 lines form the *viveka, nissitaṃ virāga, nissitaṃ nirodha, nissitaṃ vossagga, pariṇāmiṃ*. This is the *viveka, nissita* formula. Here “solitude” (*viveka*), or seclusion, has a special reference to the overcoming of the 5 mental hindrances (*pañca nīvaraṇā*). See *Viveka, nissita*, SD 20.4.

- ripening in letting go (of defilements).*
- (6) cultivates the awakening-factor that is stillness [mental concentration], *samādhī*
that is dependent on solitude,
dependent on fading away (of lust) [on dispassion],
dependent on cessation (of suffering),
ripening in letting go (of defilements).
- (7) cultivates the awakening-factor that is equanimity, *upekkhā*
that is dependent on solitude,
dependent on fading away (of lust) [on dispassion],
dependent on cessation (of suffering),
ripening in letting go (of defilements).

46.3 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(7) The noble eightfold path

47 Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would cultivate **the noble eightfold path**.¹¹¹

47.2 Here, Udāyi, a monk

- | | |
|---|-------------------------|
| (1) cultivates right view; | <i>sammā, diṭṭhi</i> |
| (2) cultivates right thought [intention]; | <i>sammā, saṅkappa</i> |
| (3) cultivates right speech; | <i>sammā, vācā</i> |
| (4) cultivates right action; | <i>sammā, kammantā,</i> |
| (5) cultivates right livelihood; | <i>sammā, ājīvā</i> |
| (6) cultivates right effort; | <i>sammā, vāyāma</i> |
| (7) cultivates right mindfulness; | <i>sammā, sati</i> |
| (8) cultivates right stillness [concentration]. | <i>sammā, samādhī</i> |

47.3 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(8) The 8 liberations

48 (8) Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would cultivate **the 8 liberations**.¹¹²

- (1) One possessing physical form sees physical forms.¹¹³
 This is the first liberation.
- (2) One does not see physical forms internally, but sees physical forms externally.¹¹⁴

¹¹¹ “The noble eightfold path” (*ariya aṭṭh’añṅika magga*). listed in **Dhamma,dāyāda S** (M 3,8-15), SD 2,18. Defined at **Sacca Vibhaṅga S** (M 141,23-31), SD 11.11; **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22,21), SD 13.2; **Mahā Cattārīsaka S** (M 117), SD 6.10.

¹¹² “The 8 liberations” (*aṭṭha, vimokkha*, Skt *aṣṭa, vimokṣā*), described in detail here but in greater detail at Pm 2:-38-40. Also listed in **Mahā, parinibbāna S** (D 16,33.3), SD 9; **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,3.1(11)); **Das’uttara S** (D 34,2.1-(10)); **Saḷ-āyatana S** (M 137,26), SD 29.5; **(Ekaka) Vimokkha S** (A 1.18,54-61/1:40 f); **(Aṭṭhaka) Vimokkha S** (A 8.66), SD 95.11; **(Peyyāla) Vimokkha S** (A 8.120). The first 3 liberations are *kaṣiṇa* meditations, and are the “bases for mastery” (*abhihāyatanā*). Liberations 4-7 are the dhyanas; and the last is the cessation of perception and feeling (*nirodha, samāpatti*). Comy on **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77,22/2:13) says that these liberations (*vimokkha*) are the mind’s full (but temporary) release from the opposing states and its full (but temporary) release by delighting in the object (MA 3:255, cf 255-259). See SD 5.17 (10); for a discussion, see **Maha Nidāna S** (D 15,35/-2:70 f), SD 5.17 (10); also Analayo 2009C:141-148. For textual context n, see Gethin 2001:206-270. For meditation context n, see Sandra Shaw 2006:92, 94. For a detailed study of the 8 liberations, see SD 49.5b (1).

¹¹³ *Rūpī rūpāni passati*. This 1st liberation refers to the attainment of the 4 dhyanas using a *kaṣiṇa* (meditation device) derived from a coloured object on our own body. See §3.33 n on “the 8 liberations.”

This is the second liberation.

(3) One is liberated after contemplating the idea of the beautiful.¹¹⁵

This is the third liberation.

(4) Through the utter transcending of the perception of physical forms, [13] the passing away of the perception of impingement [sense-contact], and non-attention to the perception of diversity, (contemplating,) ‘Space is infinite,’ one enters and dwells in the base of the infinity of space.

This is the fourth liberation.

(5) Through the utter transcending of the infinity of space, (contemplating,) ‘Consciousness is infinite,’ one enters and dwells in the base of the infinity of consciousness.

This is the fifth liberation.

(6) Through the utter transcending of the base of the infinity of consciousness, (contemplating,) ‘There is nothing,’ one enters and dwells in the base of nothingness.

This is the sixth liberation.

(7) Through the utter transcending of the base of nothingness, one enters and dwells in the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception.

This is the seventh liberation.

(8) Through the utter transcending of the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, one enters and dwells in the cessation of perception and feeling.¹¹⁶

This is the eighth liberation.

48.2 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(9) The 8 bases of mastery

49 (9) Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would cultivate **the 8 bases of mastery**.¹¹⁷

(1) Perceiving forms internally [within oneself], one sees forms *externally* [in another], limited, beautiful or ugly.¹¹⁸ By mastering [transcending] them, one perceives thus, ‘I know, I see.’¹¹⁹

This is the first base for mastery.

¹¹⁴ *Ajjhattaṃ arūpa,saññī bahiddhā rūpāni passati*. This 2nd liberation is the attainment of dhyana using a *kaṣiṇa* derived from an external object and the arising of the concentration sign externally. See §3.33 n on “the 8 liberations.”

¹¹⁵ *‘Subhan’t’eva adhimutto hoti*, lit, “One is resolved thus, ‘Beautiful!’” This 3rd liberation refers to the attainment of the perception of either a very pure, bright and beautiful (*subha*) coloured *kaṣiṇa* or of the 4 *brahma, vihārā*. See §3.33 n on “the 8 liberations” & Analayo 2009:146 f.

¹¹⁶ “The cessation of perception and feeling,” *saññā,vedayita nirodha*. This anomalous state, fully described in **Visuddhi,magga** (Vism 23.16-52/702-709), is a combination of deep meditative calm and insight where all mental states temporarily shut down (Vism 23.43/707 f): see **Sappurisa S** (M 113), SD 23.7 (2); **Mahā Vedalla S** (M 43), SD 30.2 (3).

¹¹⁷ “Bases of mastery” or “spheres of transcendence” (*abhibh’āyatana*, Skt *abhibhv-āyatana* = *abhibhū* + *āyatana*; ie, powers gained through *kaṣiṇa* (Skt *kṛtsna*) meditation as means of transcending the sense-sphere. Listed in **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,3.24), SD 9; **Saṅgīti S** (D 33.3.1(10)); **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77,72, SD 49.5a); **Parihāna Dhamma S** (S 35.96), SD 91.12; (**Ekaka**) **Abhibh’āyatana Sutta** (A 1.18.46-53/1:40); (**Aṭṭhaka**) **Abhibh’āyatana S** (A 8.65/4:305 f); **Sammā,vattana S** (A 8.90/4:349); **Nm 143**; **Dhs §§235-247**; **DhsA 191**). In **S 35.96**, the term is applied to 6 “mastered bases” (*cha abhibh’āyatana*) and refers to the mastery of the senses: when a sense-object impinges on the sense-base, “there do not arise in him bad unwholesome states, nor any memories and intentions connected with the mental fetters” (S 35.96/4:76 f). See *Buddhist Dictionary*: *abhibhāyatana*, and *Ency Bsm*, sv. For textual context n, see Gethin 2001:206-270. For meditation context n, see Sandra Shaw, *Buddhist Meditation*, 2006: 93-96. For detailed study, see SD 49.5b (2).

¹¹⁸ *Ajjhattaṃ rūpa,saññī eko bahiddhā,rūpāni passati parittāni suvaṇṇa,dubbaṇṇāni*.

¹¹⁹ *Tāni abhibhuyya jānāmi passāmīti evaṃ saññī hoti*.

(2) Perceiving forms internally, one sees forms *externally*, immeasurable, beautiful or ugly. By mastering them, one perceives thus, ‘I know, I see.’

This is the second base for mastery.

(3) Not perceiving forms internally, one sees forms *externally*, limited, beautiful or ugly. By mastering them, one perceives thus, ‘I know, I see.’

This is the third base for mastery.

(4) Not perceiving forms internally, one sees forms *externally*, immeasurable, beautiful or ugly. By mastering them, one perceives thus, ‘I know, I see.’

This is the fourth base for mastery.

(5) Not perceiving forms internally, one sees forms externally, that are blue [indigo], of blue colour, blue in appearance, with a blue glow.¹²⁰

49.2 Just as a flax flower¹²¹ that is blue, of blue colour, blue in appearance, with a blue glow; or just like Benares cloth smoothed on both sides, that is blue, blue in appearance, with a blue glow; even so, not perceiving forms internally, one seeks forms externally, blue, of blue colour, blue in appearance, with a blue glow.

By mastering them, one perceives thus, ‘I know, I see.’

This is the fifth base [14] for mastery.

(6) Not perceiving forms internally, one sees forms externally, that are yellow, of yellow colour, yellow in appearance, with a yellow glow.

49.3 Just as a cassia¹²² flower that is yellow, of yellow colour, yellow in appearance, with a yellow glow; or just like Benares cloth smoothed on both sides, that is yellow, yellow in appearance, with a yellow glow; even so, not perceiving forms internally, one seeks forms externally, yellow, of yellow colour, yellow in appearance, with a yellow glow.

By mastering them, one perceives thus, ‘I know, I see.’

This is the sixth base for mastery.

(7) Not perceiving forms internally, one sees forms externally, that are red [copper-red], of red colour, red in appearance, with a red glow.

49.4 Just as a hibiscus¹²³ flower that is red, of red colour, red in appearance, with a red glow; or just like Benares cloth smoothed on both sides, that is red, red in appearance, with a red glow; even so, not perceiving forms internally, one seeks forms externally, red, of red colour, red in appearance, with a red glow.

By mastering them, one perceives thus, ‘I know, I see.’

This is the seventh base for mastery.

(8) Not perceiving forms internally, one sees forms externally, that are white, of white colour, white in appearance, with a white glow.

49.5 Just as a morning-star¹²⁴ flower that is white, of white colour, white in appearance, with a white glow; or just like Benares cloth smoothed on both sides, that is white, white in appearance, with a white glow; even so, not perceiving forms internally, one seeks forms externally, white, of white colour, white in appearance, with a white glow.

By mastering them, one perceives thus, ‘I know, I see.’

This is the eighth base for mastery.

¹²⁰ On blue (*nīla*), yellow (*pīta*), copper-red (*lohita*) and white (*odāta*) kasinas, see *Bhāvanā*, SD 15.1 (9.2.1).

¹²¹ *Ummā, puppha*, *Linum usitatissimum*, a plant of the family Linaceae. For details, see **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,3.29) n, SD 9.

¹²² “Cassia,” *kaṇṇikāra* or *kaṇikāra* (Skt *karṇikāra*) For details, see **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,3.30) n, SD 9..

¹²³ *Bandhu, jīvaka* (PED: *Pentapetes phoenicea*, but prob *Hibiscus rosa-sinensis*) (D 2:111; M 2:14; J 4:179; Vism 174; VvA 43, 161; DhsA 14). For details, see **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,3.31) n, SD 9.

¹²⁴ *Osadhī, tāraka*, lit “the medicine star” (D 2:111; M 2:14; S 1:65; J 1:23). Also tr as “the star of healing.” *Osa-dhīsa* is the moon (Abhp 52; Sadd 380), which Indian mythology regards as the lord of healing. DPL says this is Venus (but without evidence).

49.6 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(10) The 10 kasina-bases

50 (10) Furthermore, Udāyī, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would cultivate **the 10 kasina-bases**.¹²⁵

- | | | |
|---|---|------------------------|
| (1) One perceives <u>the earth kasina</u> ¹²⁶ | above, below, across, undivided, immeasurable. ¹²⁷ | <i>paṭhavī kasina</i> |
| (2) One perceives <u>the water kasina</u> ¹²⁹ | above, below, across, undivided, immeasurable. | <i>apo, kasina</i> |
| (3) One perceives <u>the fire kasina</u> ¹³⁰ | above, below, across, undivided, immeasurable. | <i>tejo, kasina</i> |
| (4) One perceives <u>the wind kasina</u> ¹³¹ | above, below, across, undivided, immeasurable. | <i>vāyo, kasina</i> |
| (5) One perceives <u>the blue kasina</u> ¹³² | above, below, across, undivided, immeasurable. | <i>nīla, kasina</i> |
| (6) One perceives <u>the yellow kasina</u> ¹³³ | above, below, across, undivided, immeasurable. | <i>pīta, kasina</i> |
| (7) One perceives <u>the red kasina</u> ¹³⁴ | above, below, across, undivided, immeasurable. | <i>lohita, kasina</i> |
| (8) One perceives <u>the white kasina</u> ¹³⁵ | above, below, across, undivided, immeasurable. | <i>odāta, kasina</i> |
| (9) One perceives <u>the space kasina</u> [15] | above, below, across, undivided, immeasurable. ¹³⁶ | <i>ākāsa, kasina</i> |
| (10) One perceives <u>the consciousness kasina</u> ¹³⁷ | above, below, across, undivided, immeasurable. | <i>viññāna, kasina</i> |

50.2 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(11) The 4 dhyanas

51 Furthermore, Udāyī, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would cultivate **the dhyanas**.¹³⁸

- (1) Here, Udāyī,¹³⁹ a monk,

¹²⁵ *Puna c'aparam udāyī akkhātā mayā sāvakanāṃ paṭipadā, yathā, paṭipannā me sāvakā dasa kasināyatanāni bhāventi.* For a table of the 10 kasinas, see SD 15.1 (Fig 8.1). On the practical aspects of kasina meditation, see SD 15.1 (9.2). Buddhaghosa discusses the earth kasina in great detail in *Vism* ch 4, and the other 9 kasinas in ch 5, where he has “light kasina” (*Vism* 5.21-23) and “limited space kasina” (*Vism* 5.25-26) instead of immeasurable space and consciousness [§]. For a scholarly analysis on kasinas, see Sarah Shaw 2006:86-100 (ch 6). For detailed study, see SD 49.5b (3). For the light kasina, see SD 49.5b (1.11).

¹²⁶ “Perceives,” *sañjānāti*, also “cognizes, apperceive.” Here, it is best to take “perceive” in a non-technical sense, in the sense of “contemplate (on an object, usually external).” This verb is convenient as the noun, *saññā*, is usually tr as “perception.” It helps to be circumspect that a word often has many different senses, and we should be aware of its sense when we deal with it. For details, see **Saññā**, SD 17.4, esp (2.1.3.3; 7.1.4).

¹²⁷ On the earth kasina, see SD 49.5b (1.1).

¹²⁸ *Pathavī, kasinaṃ eko sañjānāti uddham adho tiriyaṃ advayaṃ appamaññaṃ.*

¹²⁹ On the water kasina, see SD 49.5b (1.2).

¹³⁰ On the fire kasina, see SD 49.5b (1.3).

¹³¹ On the wind kasina, see SD 49.5b (1.4).

¹³² On the blue kasina, see SD 49.5b (1.5).

¹³³ On the yellow kasina, see SD 49.5b (1.6).

¹³⁴ On the red kasina, see SD 49.5b (1.7).

¹³⁵ On the white kasina, see SD 49.5b (1.8).

¹³⁶ On the space kasina, see SD 49.5b (1.9). Buddhaghosa replaces this with the “limited space” kasina (*Vism* 5.25-26). See §53 n & (6.9).

¹³⁷ On the consciousness kasina, see SD 49.5b (1.10). Buddhaghosa replaces this with the “light kasina” (*Vism* 5.21-23): see SD 49.5b (1.11). See also SD 17.8a (4.1) & above (6.10).

¹³⁸ On the 4 dhyanas (*catu jhāna*), see **Dhyana**, SD 8.4.

¹³⁹ This whole section on the 4 dhyanas, with their similes [§§54.1] (without their native refrains), is stock: see **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,76-84), SD 8.10. There is only one “native refrain” here, ie, §54.9; **Sāmañña, phala S** has a refrain after each section on the dhyanas.

quite secluded from sensual pleasures, solitary from unwholesome mental states, attains and dwells in the **first dhyana**, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, and with zest and happiness born of solitude.¹⁴⁰

He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body¹⁴¹ with the zest and happiness born of solitude.¹⁴²

51.2 Udāyi, just as if a skilled bathman or bathman's apprentice would pour bath powder into a brass basin and knead it together, sprinkling it again and again with water, so that his ball of bath lather — saturated, moisture-laden, permeated within and without—would not drip;

51.3 even so, Udāyi, the monk permeates—this very body with the zest and happiness born of solitude. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by zest and happiness born of solitude.

(2) Again, Udāyi, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he attains and dwells in **the second dhyana**, free from initial application and sustained application, with zest and happiness born of concentration.¹⁴³

He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the zest and happiness born of concentration.

51.4 Udāyi, just as a lake with spring-water welling up from within, having *no* inflow from the east, *no* inflow from the west, *no* inflow from the north, or *no* inflow from the south, [16] and with the skies *not* bringing heavy rain over and again.¹⁴⁴

Yet the cool spring welling up from within the lake would permeate and pervade, flood and fill it with cool waters—there being no part of the lake unpervaded by the cool waters.

51.5 Even so, the monk permeates this very body with the zest and happiness born of concentration. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by zest and happiness born of concentration.

(3) Again, Udāyi, with the fading away of zest, he dwells equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and experiences happiness with the body. He attains and dwells in **the third dhyana**, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’

He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the happiness free from zest.

51.6 Udāyi, just as in a pond of the blue lotuses, red and white lotuses, or red lotuses,¹⁴⁵ born and growing in the water, stay immersed in the water and flourish without standing up out of the water, so that they are permeated, pervaded, suffused and filled with cool water from their roots to their tips, and nothing of those lotuses would be unpervaded with cool water;

51.7 even so, the monk permeates this very body with the happiness free from zest, so that there is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded with this happiness free from zest.

¹⁴⁰ “Born of solitude,” *viveka.ja*; ie it is the result of abandoning the hindrances: on the 3 kinds of solitude, see **The Body in Buddhism**, SD 29.6a (1.5). On the omission of “one-pointedness of mind” (*cittassa ek’aggatā*) and “concentration” (*samādhi*) here, see **The layman and dhyana**, SD 8.5.

¹⁴¹ Here “body” (*kāya*) refers to the “mental body” (*nāma,kāya*), ie feeling (*vedanā*), perception (*saññā*), formations (*sankhāra*), and consciousness (*viññāṇa*) (*Vism* 4.175/169).

¹⁴² These are the dhyana-factors: *vitakka vicāra pīti sukhassa ek’aggatā*, respectively.

¹⁴³ The 2nd dhyana is known as “the noble silence” (*ariya,tuñhī,bhāva*) because within it initial application and sustained application (thinking and discursion, *vitakka,vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur. (S 2:273); cf. S 4:293 where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī,sankhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. In **Ariya,pariyesanā S** (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to “either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence” (ie either talk Dharma or meditate). See **Dutiya Jhāna Pañha S** (S 40.2/4:263 f), SD 24.12.

¹⁴⁴ Be Ee *devo ca na kālena kālaṃ sammā dhāraṃ anupaveccheyya. Ce devo ca kālena kālaṃ sammā dhāraṃ nā-nupaveccheyya*. Se omits *na: devo ca kālena kālaṃ sammā dhāraṃ anupaveccheyya*. See D 1:74 n6. For preferring the *na* reading, see **Dhyana**, SD 8.4 (8.2).

¹⁴⁵ *uppala* (Skt *utpala*), *paduma* (*padma*) and *puṇḍarīka* respectively. This simile also found in **Kāya,gatā,sati S** (M 119.20/3:93 f), SD 12.21. See **Āyācana S** (S 6.1) where the simile of lotuses in a pond is applied to beings of different spiritual dispositions (S 6.1/1:138), SD 12.2.

(4) Again, Udāyī, with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain,¹⁴⁶ and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure, attains and dwells in **the fourth dhyana** that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.¹⁴⁷

He sits, pervading the body with a pure, bright mind,¹⁴⁸ so that there is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded by a pure, bright mind.

51.8 Udāyī, just as if a man were sitting covered from head to foot with a white cloth, so that there would be no part of his body to which the white cloth did not extend;

51.9 even so, the monk sits, permeating the body with a pure, bright mind. There is no part of his entire body [17] that is not pervaded by pure, bright mind.

51.10 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(12) Insight knowledge (of the conscious body)

52 Furthermore, Udāyī, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would know thus:¹⁴⁹

“**This body of mine** is form composed of the 4 great elements,¹⁵⁰ born from mother and father, nourished with rice and porridge, subject to inconstancy, rubbing, pressing, dissolution, and dispersion.¹⁵¹ And this consciousness of mine lies attached here, bound up here.”¹⁵²

52.2 ¹⁵³Udāyī, just as if there were a beautiful beryl¹⁵⁴ gem of the purest water—eight faceted, well polished and cut [well worked], clear, limpid, consummate in all its aspects, through which runs a blue, or

¹⁴⁶ “Joy...pain,” *sukha...dukkha*: this refers to *physical* feelings. The next phrase—“pleasure and displeasure,” *domanassa...somanassa*—refers to *mental* feelings, transcended earlier. Mental feelings must be overcome first so that the mind is not distracted by itself, as it were. Then, all the other feelings (arising from the physical sense-contacts) are transcended. On the significance of this, see **Sall’atthena S** (S 36.6/4:207-210), SD 5.5.

¹⁴⁷ Here, **Vibhaṅga** gives 3 factors of the 4th dhyana—equanimity (*upekhā*), mindfulness (*sati*) and one-pointedness of mind (*cittassa ek’aggatā*)—according to the Sutta analysis (Vbh 261), and 2 factors—equanimity and one-pointedness of the mind—according to the Abhidhamma analysis (Vbh 164; Vism 4.183/165). See also **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.83/1:75), SD 8.10 & **Dhyana**, SD 8.4 (5.4).

¹⁴⁸ See **Accharā Vagga** (A 1.6.1-2): “Monks, this mind is radiant (*pabhassara*), but it is defiled by defilements from outside. The ignorant ordinary person does not understand this as it really is. As such, for him there is no personal development.” (A 1:10). On reaching the 4th dhyana, the practitioner becomes directly aware of the naturally and truly pure state of the mind. See also A:ÑB 1999 §4.

¹⁴⁹ The foll para recurs in **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,85.2), SD 8.10; (**Ānanda**) **Subha S** (D 10,2.21-22/1:209), SD 40a.13.

¹⁵⁰ The 4 great (or primary) elements (*mahā,bhūtā*): earth, water, fire, wind (D 1:214; Vism 11.27; Abhs 154); see **Rūpa**, SD 17.2a.

¹⁵¹ See **Vammika S** (M 23,4/1:144) for parable of the anthill (representing the body).

¹⁵² *Puna caparaṃ udāyī akkhātā mayā sāvakaṇaṃ paṭipadā, yathā paṭipannā me sāvakā evaṃ pajānanti “ayaṃ kho me kāyo rūpī cātu,mahā,bhūtiko mātā,pettika,sambhavo odana,kummāsūpacayo anicc,ucchādana,parimaddana,bhedana,viddhaṃ sanadhammo, idaṃ ca pana me viññāṇaṃ ettha sitaṃ ettha paṭibaddhaṃ. D 2,85/1:76 (×2) = M 109,9/2:17; M 23,4/1:144, 74,9/500; S 35,105/4:83 = A 9.15,2/4:386; S 55.21/5:369 f; Nigrodha,miga J 12/1:146. Cf Divy 180: śatana,patana,vikiraṇa, vidhvaṃsanā,dharmatā. See **Dīgha,nakha S** (M 74.9/1:500), SD 16.1 tr & nn. This statement means that consciousness here (in a physical being) is dependent on the physical body. RD points out that this and other passages disprove the idea that the consciousness (*viññāṇa*) transmigrates. For holding such a view, Sāti was severely rebuked by the Buddha (M 38). A new re-linking consciousness (*paṭisandhi*) arises at conception, dependent on the old one (see Vism 17.164 ff). [§58n]*

¹⁵³ This and prec para are at **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,85-88/1:76 f) = **Subha S** (D 10,2.21-22/1:209) = **Mahā Sakul’udāyī S** (M 77,29/2:17). The beryl simile, relating to the Bodhisattva’s gestation period (as a foetus), at **Mahāpadāna S** (D 14,1.21/2:13) = **Accharīya Abbhūta S** (M 123,12/3:121). *Paṇḍu,sutta* occurs in **Vidhura Paṇḍita J** (J 545/6:305), where E B Cowell & W H D Rouse tr it as “white thread” (J:CR 6:147).

¹⁵⁴ *Veluriya*: from a metathesis of *veruliya* comes Greek *beryllos*, “beryl,” whence German *Brille*, “spectacles” (originally, of beryl). (Walshe)

yellow, or red, or white thread, or brown thread¹⁵⁵—and a man with good eyesight, taking it in his hand, were to reflect on it thus:¹⁵⁶

‘This is a beautiful beryl gem of the purest water—*eight faceted, well polished, clear, limpid, consummate in all its aspects, through which runs a blue, or yellow, or red, or white, or brown thread.*’¹⁵⁷

52.3 Even so, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising which they would know thus:

‘*This body of mine is form, composed of the four great elements, born from mother and father, nourished with rice and porridge, subject to uncertainty, rubbing, pressing, breaking up and destruction. And this consciousness of mine lies attached here, bound up here.*’¹⁵⁸

52.4 And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.

(13) Knowledge of the mind-made body¹⁵⁹

53 Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, **they create from this body another body**, endowed with form,¹⁶⁰ **mind-made**, complete in all its parts, without defect in any faculty.¹⁶¹

53.2 Udāyi, just as if a man were to draw a muñja reed from its sheath, the thought would occur to him:

‘This is the sheath, this is the reed. The sheath is one thing, the reed another, but the reed has been drawn out from the sheath.’

53.3 Or, Udāyi, as if a man were to draw a sword from its scabbard. The thought would occur to him:

‘This is the sword, this is the scabbard. The sword is one thing, the scabbard another, but the sword has been drawn out from the scabbard.’

53.4 Or, [18] Udāyi, as if a man were to pull a snake out from its slough. The thought would occur to him:

‘This is the snake, this is the slough. The snake is one thing, the slough another, but the snake has been pulled out from the slough’;

¹⁵⁵ “Through which runs...etc,” *tatra suttam āvutaṃ nīlaṃ vā pītaṃ vā lohitaṃ vā odātaṃ vā paṇḍu, suttam vā*: as in **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,86.1), SD 8.10 (where see n). Comys offer no explanation, except that the gem “is like the physical body, and the thread running through it is like insight knowledge (*vipassanā, ñāṇa*)” (DA 1:211). DANT (New Subcomy) corrects “insight knowledge” to “insight consciousness” (*vipassanā, viññāṇa*, DANT:VRI 2:126). It is possible that the 6 colours represent the 6 sense-consciousnesses. The first 4 colours are those of the colour *kaṣiṇa* meditations: see **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16.3.29-32/2:110 f), SD 9. See **Viññāṇa**, SD 17.8a (4.1).

¹⁵⁶ *Seyyathā pi udāyi maṇi veḷuriyo subho jātimā aṭṭhaṃ so suparikamma, kato accho vippasanno sabb’ākāra, sampanno, tatr’idaṃ suttam āvutaṃ nīlaṃ vā pītaṃ vā lohitaṃ vā odātaṃ vā paṇḍu, suttam vā, tam enaṃ cakkhumā puriso hatthe karitvā paccavekkheyya ‘ayaṃ kho maṇi veḷuriyo subho jātimā aṭṭhaṃ so suparikamma, kato accho vippasanno sabb’ākāra, sampanno, tatr’idaṃ suttam āvutaṃ nīlaṃ vā pītaṃ vā lohitaṃ vā odātaṃ vā paṇḍu, suttam vā’ti.*

¹⁵⁷ *Ayaṃ kho maṇi veḷuriyo subho jātimā aṭṭhaṃ so suparikamma, kato accho vippasanno sabb’ākāra, sampanno, tatr’idaṃ suttam āvutaṃ nīlaṃ vā pītaṃ vā lohitaṃ vā odātaṃ vā paṇḍu, suttam vā’ti.*

¹⁵⁸ This statement means that consciousness here (in a physical being) is dependent on the physical body. [§55]

¹⁵⁹ “Mind-made body,” *mano, mayā kāya*: as in **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,87-88), but omitting the opening para, “With his mind thus concentrated ... creating a mind-made body” (§87.1): see SD 8.10 n. This is clearly the kind of body that is meant in terms of psychic powers, when it is able to multiply itself, appear and disappear, go through solid objects, travel astrally, etc. In such the actual physical body remains intact, in some deep level of samadhi (but is outside of dhyana, which is thought-free).

¹⁶⁰ Exactly the same as the physical body (but mentally created). This mind-made body is what is mistaken for a soul or self.

¹⁶¹ *Ahīn-indriya*: D 2:13,17 (DA 11), 436,8-10 = M 3:121,20 (MA 4:181,11-13); D 1:77,11 ≠ M 2:17,26 (MA = AA); 18,6; Nm 340,15; Nc 209,21; D I 34,24 (= *paripunn’indriyo*, AA), 186,14 f, 195,26.

53.5 even so, Udāyī, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, *they create from this body another body*, endowed with form, *mind-made*, complete in all its parts, without defect in any faculty.

53.6 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

THE 5 SUPERKNOWLEDGES (mundane) [§§57-61]

(14) Psychic powers

54 Furthermore, Udāyī, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, they experience **the manifold psychic powers**.¹⁶²

- (1) Having been one he becomes many; having been many they become one.
- (2) They appear, and vanish.
- (3) They go unhindered through walls, through ramparts, and through mountains as if through space.
- (4) They dive in and out of the earth as if it were water.
- (5) They walk on water without sinking as if it were earth.
- (6) Sitting cross-legged, they fly through the air like [19] a winged bird.
- (7) With their hands they touch and stroke even the sun and the moon, so mighty, so powerful.
- (8) They have power over their body up to as far as the Brahmā world.

54.2 Udāyī, just as a skilled potter or his assistant could craft from well-prepared clay whatever kind of pottery vessel he likes,

54.3 or, Udāyī, as a skilled ivory-carver or his assistant could craft from well-prepared ivory any kind of ivory-work he likes,

54.4 or, Udāyī, as a skilled goldsmith or his assistant could craft from well-prepared gold any kind of gold article he likes—

54.5 even so, Udāyī, *the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, they experience the manifold psychic powers.*

- (1) *Having been one they become many; having been many they become one.*
- (2) *They appear, and vanish.*
- (3) *They go unhindered through walls, through ramparts, and through mountains as if through space.*
- (4) *They dive in and out of the earth as if it were water.*
- (5) *They walk on water without sinking as if it were earth.*
- (6) *Sitting cross-legged, they fly through the air like a winged bird.*
- (7) *With their hands they touch and stroke even the sun and the moon, so mighty, so powerful.*
- (8) *They have power over their body up to as far as the Brahmā world.*

54.6 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(15) CLAIRAUDIENCE (DIVINE EAR)

55 Furthermore, Udāyī, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, they hear, by means of **the divine-ear element**,¹⁶³ purified and surpassing the human, both kinds of sounds: divine and human, whether near or far.

55.2 Udāyī, just as if a man travelling along a highway were to hear the sounds of bheri [conical drum], mridanga [tom-tom],¹⁶⁴ conch-shell, cymbals, and dindima [small drum], he would know,

¹⁶² As at Sāmañña,phala S (D 2,89-90), SD 8.10. Cf Kevaḍḍha S (D 11) where the Buddha disapproves of exhibiting such powers (D 11,4-5/1:213 f), SD 1.7. See Miracles, SD 27.15a.

¹⁶³ “Divine-ear element,” *dibba,sota,dhātu*, clairaudience. See Miracles, SD 27.5a (5.2).

¹⁶⁴ “Mridanga,” *mutiṅgā*, v1 *mudiṅgā* (V 1:15, S 2:267). See Āṇi S (S 20.7.2), SD 11.13.

‘That is bheri sound; that is mridanga sound; that is conch sound; that is cymbal sound; that is dindi-ma sound’—

even so, Udāyi, *the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, they hear, by means of the divine ear-element, purified and surpassing the human, both kinds of sounds: divine and human, whether near or far.*

55.3 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

(16) MIND-READING

56 Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, **they know the minds of other beings**, other individuals, having encompassed them with his own mind.¹⁶⁵

56.2 They know [understand] a mind with lust as a mind	with lust,
and a mind without lust as a mind	without lust.
They know a mind with aversion as a mind	with aversion,
and a mind without aversion as a mind	without aversion.
They know a mind with delusion as a mind	with delusion,
and a mind without delusion as a mind	without delusion.
They know a contracted mind as	a contracted mind, ¹⁶⁶
and a distracted mind as	a distracted mind. ¹⁶⁷
They know an exalted mind as	an exalted mind, ¹⁶⁸
and an unexalted mind as	an unexalted mind. ¹⁶⁹
They know a surpassable mind as	a surpassable mind,
and an unsurpassable mind as	an unsurpassable mind ¹⁷⁰ .
They know a concentrated mind as	a concentrated mind,
and an unconcentrated mind as	an unconcentrated mind.
They know a released mind as	a released mind,
and an unreleased mind as	an unreleased mind.

56.3 Udāyi, just as if a man or woman, a youth or a maiden,¹⁷¹ fond of ornaments, examining the reflection of his or her own face in a bright mirror or a bowl of clear water would know ‘blemished’ [20] if it were blemished, or ‘unblemished’ if it were not—

56.4 even so, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, *they know the minds of other beings, other individuals, having encompassed them with his own mind.*

<i>They know [understand] a mind with lust as a mind</i>	<i>with lust,</i>
<i>and a mind without lust as a mind</i>	<i>without lust.</i>
<i>They know a mind with aversion as a mind</i>	<i>with aversion,</i>
<i>and a mind without aversion as a mind</i>	<i>without aversion.</i>
<i>They know a mind with delusion as a mind</i>	<i>with delusion,</i>
<i>and a mind without delusion as a mind</i>	<i>without delusion.</i>

¹⁶⁵ The following section (italicized) is a list of mental states apparently taken from **Satipaṭṭhāna Ss** (D 22,12/-2:299 = M 10.34/1:59), where it fits more appropriately. (Walshe, D:W 546 n131). On another def of mind-reading (4 kinds), see **Sampasādaniya S** (D 28.6/3:103 f), SD 14.10.

¹⁶⁶ Due to sloth and torpor, the 3rd mental hindrance: see **Nīvaraṇa**, SD 32.1 & **Thīma,middha**, SD 32.6.

¹⁶⁷ Due to restlessness and remorse, the 4th mental hindrance: see **Nīvaraṇa**, SD 32.1 & **Uddhacca,kukkucca**, SD 32.7.

¹⁶⁸ Due to attaining dhyana.

¹⁶⁹ Due to not attaining dhyana.

¹⁷⁰ Unsurpassable (*anuttaram*) mind, probably synonymous with “developed” mind. See D:W 592 n667.

¹⁷¹ *Itthī vā puriso vā daharo yuvā.*, as at V 2:255, 3:68; **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,92/1:80); **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77,19,31/2:19), **Ākaṅkheyya S** (M 5/1:32), **Vitakka,saṅṭhāna S** (M 20/1:119); **Jātaka Nidāna,kathā** (J 1:5).

They know a contracted mind
and a distracted mind
They know an exalted mind as
and an unexalted mind as
They know a surpassable mind as
and an unsurpassable mind as
They know a concentrated mind as
and an unconcentrated mind as
They know a released mind as
and an unreleased mind as

a contracted mind,¹⁷²
a distracted mind.¹⁷³
an exalted mind,¹⁷⁴
an unexalted mind.¹⁷⁵
a surpassable mind,
an unsurpassable mind¹⁷⁶.
a concentrated mind,
an unconcentrated mind.
a released mind,
an unreleased mind.

—they know each of them just as it is.

56.5 And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.

(17) The knowledge of the recollection of past lives¹⁷⁷

57 Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, **they (each) recollect their manifold past existence**, that is to say, one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births, ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births, one hundred births, one thousand births, one hundred thousand births, many aeons of cosmic contraction, many aeons of cosmic expansion, many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, thus:

‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.’

Thus, Udāyi, they recollect their manifold past lives in their modes and details.¹⁷⁸

57.2 PARABLE OF THE TRAVELLER. Just as if a man were to go from his home village to another village, and then from that village to yet another village, and then from that village back to his home village. The thought would occur to him,

‘I went from my home village to that village over there. There I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way.

From that village I went to that village over there, and there [21] I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way.

From that village I came back home.’¹⁷⁹

57.3 Even so, Udāyi, *the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such,*

¹⁷² Due to sloth-and-torpor, the 3rd mental hindrance: see *Nīvaraṇa*, SD 32.1 & *Thīma,middha*, SD 32.6.

¹⁷³ Due to restlessness-and-remorse, the 4th mental hindrance: see *Nīvaraṇa*, SD 32.1 & *Uddhacca,kukkucca*, SD 32.7.

¹⁷⁴ Due to attaining dhyana.

¹⁷⁵ Due to not attaining dhyana.

¹⁷⁶ Unsurpassable (*anuttaram*) mind, probably synonymous with “developed” mind. See D:W 592 n667.

¹⁷⁷ *Pubbe,nivāsanānussati,nāṇa*, lit “the knowledge of the recollection of past abidings [existences].” The remainder of this is expanded into 4 sections in **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1,1.31-34/1:13-16 @ SD 25.3(76.3)) and 3 sections in **Sampasādaniya S** (D 27,15-17/3:107-112), SD 10.12. In both cases, each explains how the eternalist view arose. This knowledge and the foll three (ie 4-6) constitute “the 3 knowledges” (*te,vijjā*) of the Buddha and the arhats (D 3:220, 275; A 5:211), and is a shorthand for “the 6 knowledges” (*cha-l-ābhiñña*) listed here and elsewhere.

¹⁷⁸ This knowledge is detailed at Vism 13.13-71/411-423.

¹⁷⁹ The 3 villages represent the “3 existences” (*tīsu bhavesu*), ie, the sense world, the form world, and the formless world (DA 1:224).

*they (each) recollect their manifold past existence, that is to say,
one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births,
ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births,
one hundred births, one thousand births, one hundred thousand births,
many aeons of cosmic contraction, many aeons of cosmic expansion,
many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, thus:*

‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.’

Thus, Udāyi, they recollect their manifold past lives in their modes and details.

57.4 And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge. [22]

(18) The divine eye (knowledge of death and birth according to karma)¹⁸⁰

58 Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, they see—by means of **the divine eye** [clairvoyance],¹⁸¹ purified and surpassing the human—beings passing away and re-arising, and they know how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states, faring in accordance with their karma:

58.2 ‘Those beings—who were endowed with bad conduct of body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—after death, with the body’s breaking up, have re-arisen in a plane of misery, a bad destination, a lower realm, in hell.

But those beings—who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—after death, with the body’s breaking up, have reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven.’

58.3 Thus, Udāyi, by means of the divine eye, they see beings passing away and re-arising, and *how they fare according to* their karma.

58.4 PARABLE OF THE CITY SQUARE.¹⁸² Udāyi, just as if there were a mansion in the central square [where four roads meet], and a man with good eyesight standing on top of it were to see people entering a house, leaving it, wandering along the carriage-road, and sitting down in the central square [where four roads meet]. The thought would occur to him,

‘These people are entering a house, leaving it, walking along the streets, and sitting down in the central square [where four roads meet].’¹⁸³

58.5 Even so, Udāyi, *the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, they see—by means of the divine eye, purified and surpassing the human—beings passing away and re-arising, and they know how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states, faring in accordance with their karma:*

58.6 ‘Those beings—who were endowed with bad conduct of body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—after death,

¹⁸⁰ *Cutūpapāta ñāṇa*, “the knowledge of the falling away and rebirth (of beings),” or “knowledge of rebirth according to karma” (*yathā,kammūpaga ñāṇa*), or “the divine eye” (*dibba,cakkhu*): see foll n.

¹⁸¹ *Dibba,cakkhu*, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (*dhamma,cakkhu*) (see n in §104). On the relationship of this knowledge to the 62 grounds for wrong views, see **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1), SD 25.3(76.3). See prec n.

¹⁸² On this parable, see also SD 2.17 (8).

¹⁸³ On the significance of this simile in confirming canonical acceptance of the intermediate state (*antarā,bhava*), see “**Is Rebirth Immediate?**” SD 2.17 (8).

with the body's breaking up, have re-arisen in a plane of misery, an bad destination, a lower realm, in hell.

But those beings—who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—after death, with the body's breaking up, have reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven.’

58.7 Thus, Udāyi, by means of **the divine eye**, they see beings passing away and re-arising, and how they fare according to their karma.

58.8 And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.

THE 6TH SUPERKNOWLEDGE direct knowledge (supramundane) [§62]

(19) The knowledge of the destruction of mental influxes¹⁸⁴ [22]

59 Furthermore, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, having right here and now realized for himself through direct knowledge, attained and dwelled in the freedom of mind **and freedom by wisdom**¹⁸⁵ that are influx-free with the destruction of the mental influxes.¹⁸⁶

59.2 Udāyi, just as if there were a **pool of water in a mountain glen**, clear, limpid, unsullied,¹⁸⁷ where, a person with good eyes, from its edge, would see shellfish and shells, or gravel and pebbles, or shoals of fish moving about or resting in it,¹⁸⁸ and it would occur to him,

‘This pool of water is clear, limpid, and unsullied. Here are these shells, gravel, and pebbles, and also these shoals of fish swimming about and resting.’

¹⁸⁴ Occurrences of this “dual-attained” arhathood pericope is given in the Appendix.

¹⁸⁵ “**Freedom of mind and freedom through wisdom**,” respectively, *ceto, vimutti* (or, freedom by concentration, ie through destruction of the mental hindrances) and *paññā, vimutti* (freedom through insight) (A 1:60). One who is freed by wisdom “may not have reached the 8 liberation or deliverances (*vimokkha = jhāna*) in his own body, but through seeing with wisdom, his mental influxes are destroyed” (M 70,16/1:478). All arhats are perfectly freed in the same way from ignorance and suffering, but are distinguished into two types on the basis of their proficiency in concentration. Those who can attain **the 8 liberations** (*aṭṭha, vimokkha*), which include the 4 formless attainments and the attainment of cessation, are called *freed both ways*, that is, freed from the physical body by means of the formless dhyanas, and from all defilements by the path of arhathood [§3.33]. Saḷha, like the arhats Sāriputta and Moggallāna, is “freed both ways” (*ubhato, bhāga, vimutta*). The differences between the two types of freedom are given in **Mahā, nidāna S** (D 2:70 f) and **Kīṭāgiri S** (M 1:477 f). For full list of the 8 liberations, see **Mahā Nidāna S** (D 15,35/2:70 f), SD 5.17.35. See also D 3:262, 228; **Vimokkha S**, A 8.66/4:306; also M 120.37/3:103, SD 3.4.37. See also **Aṭṭha Vimokkha**, SD 62.5 & Analayo 2009:141-148.

¹⁸⁶ “With the destruction of the mental influxes destroyed,” *khīṇ’āsava*. The term *āsava* (lit “inflow, outflow”) comes from *ā-savati* “flows towards” (ie either “into” or towards the observer). It has been variously translated as taints (“deadly taints,” RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, bad (influences), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists 4 *āsava*: the influx of (1) sense-desire (*kām’āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav’āsava*), (3) wrong views (*diṭṭh’āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijjāsava*) (D 16,2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These 4 are also known as “floods” (*ogha*) and “yokes” (*yoga*). The list of 3 influxes (omitting the influx of views) is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these *āsavas* is equivalent to arhathood. See BDict under *āsava*.

¹⁸⁷ “Clear, limpid, unsullied,” *accho vipassanno anāvilo*.

¹⁸⁸ *Udaka, rahado accho vipassanno anāvilo tattha cakkhumā puriso tīre ṭhito passeyya sippi, sambukam pi sakkhara, kathalam pi maccha, gumbam pi carantam pi tiṭṭhantam pi*. This whole section also in **Pañihita Acchanna Vagga** (A 1.5.5-6) in the same context, differently worded.

59.3 Even so, Udāyi, the path has been shown to my disciples, practising as such, *having right here and now realized for themselves through direct knowledge, attained the liberation of mind and liberation by wisdom that are influx-free with the destruction of the mental influxes, they dwell therein.*

59.4 *And, in this way, many disciples of mine dwell having attained the accomplishment and perfection of direct knowledge.*

60 This, Udāyi, is **the fifth quality** that my disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour, and, having honoured and respected, they dwell in dependence.

61 These, Udāyi, are **the 5 qualities**, on account of which my disciples revere, respect, esteem, honour me, and, having honoured and respected me, they dwell in dependence.

62 The Blessed One said this. The wanderer Sakul’udāyi, joyful at heart, approved of the Blessed One’s word.

— evaṃ —

Appendix:

The “dual-attained” arhathood pericope

This pericope occurs in the Suttas listed below. D and M references are to “Sutta number, paragraph(s),” including series and repeats, following the SD numbering. Also note that only translated titles or those earmarked for translation have SD numbers.

<u>Breakdown of occurrences:</u>	<u>Total suttas</u>	<u>Total occurrences</u>
Dīgha Nikāya	7	9
Majjhima Nikāya	14	38
Saṃyutta Nikāya	20	24
Aṅguttara Nikāya	56	64
Udāna	1	1
Iti,vuttaka	3	3
Vibhaṅga	1	1
Puggala Paññatti	6	8
	-----	-----
Total occurrences:	108 suttas	145 occurrences

Mahāli S (D 6,13), SD 53.4; **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,2.6), SD 9; **Mahā Govinda S** (D 19,62), SD 63.4; **Cakka,vatti Siha,nāda S** (D 26,28(5)), SD 36.10; **Sampasādanīya S** (D 28,3.2 + 13(4) + 14(4)), SD 14.14; **Pāsādika S** (D 29,25(4)), SD 40a.6; **Das’uttara S** (D 34,1.7(10f)), one of the 6 states to be realized;

Ākaṅkheyya S (M 6,19), SD 59.1; **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,19.1+2, 28.2, 36(6), 42,1+2, 42.5+6), SD 49.1; **Cūḷa Assa,pura S** (M 40,14.1-5), SD 41.8; **Sāleyyaka S** (M 41,43), SD 5.7; **Verañjaka S** (M 42,43); **Sekha S** (M 53,22+24), SD 21.14; **(Gaha,pati) Potaliya S** (M 54,24), SD 43.8; **Te,vijja Vaccha,gotta S** (M 71,9), SD 53.3; **Mahā Vaccha,gotta S** (M 73,7.1+2, 8.1+2, 24), SD 27.4; **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77,61.1+3), SD 49.5; **Gopaka Moggallāna S** (M 108,23), SD 33.5; **Kāya,gata,sati S** (M 119,42), SD 12.21; **Saṅkhār’upapatti S** (M 120,37.2+3), SD 3.4; **Nandak’ovāda S** (M 146,13×2, 25×2), SD 66.12;

Jhānābhiñña S (S 16.9/2:214×2), SD 98.7; **Upassaya S** (S 16.10/2:217×4), SD 92.7; **Cīvara S** (S 16.11/2:222), SD 77.5; **(Pañc’indriya) Āsava-k,khaya S** (S 48.20/5:203); **Sāketa S** (S 48.43/2:220);

(Iddhi,pāda) Bhikkhu S 1 (S 51.7/2:257×6); **Pubba S** (S 51.11/2:266); **Maha-p,phala S** (S 51.12/2:-268); **(Pasāda Kampana) Moggallāna S** (S 51.14/2:271), SD 27.8; **(Iddhi,pāda) Bhikkhu S 2** (S 51.18-/2:275, 276); **Iddhi,pāda Vibhaṅga S** (S 51.20/2:280 f), SD 28.14; **(Iddhi,pāda) Bhikkhu S 3** (S 51.23/-2:284); **(Iddhi) Moggallāna S** (S 51.31/2:289), SD 27.7; **(Iddhi,pāda) Tathāgata S** (S 51.32/2:290); **(Satipaṭṭhāna) Āsava-kkhaya S** (S 52.24/5:305); **Giṅjak'āvasatha S 1** (S 55.8/5:356); **Giṅjak'āvasatha S 2** (S 55.9/5:358); **Sarakāni S 1** (S 55.24/5:376), SD 3.6; **Sarakāni S 2** (S 55.25/5:378), SD 10.5; **Abhisāṇḍa S 2** (S 55.42/5:406);

Sāraṇīya S (A 3.12/1:107); **Āsaṃsa S** (A 3.13/1:108×5); **Bahu,kāra S** (A 3.24/1:123), SD 85.1; **Vajirūpama S** (A 3.25/1:124); **Mahānāma Sakka S** (A 3.73/1:220); **Nigaṇṭha S** (A 3.74/1:221); **Sekha Uddesa S 1** (A 3.85/1:232), SD 3.3; **Sekha Uddesa S 2** (A 3.86/1:234), SD 80.13; **Sekha Uddesa S 3** (A 3.87/1:234), SD 80.14; **Sikkha-t,taya S 2** (A 3.89/1:236), SD 47.17; **Ājānīya S 3** (A 3.96/1:246); **Paṇḍu,dhovaka S** (A 3.100a/1:256), SD 19.11; **Moneyya S** (A 3.120/1:273); **Āss'ājānīya S** (A 3.140/1:291); **Anusota S** (A 4.5/2:6); **Uruvela S 2** (A 4.22/2:23); **(Mahā,purisa) Vāssa,kāra S** (A 4.35/2:36×2, 2:37), SD 82.9; **Samaṇa-m-acala S 1** (A 4.87/2:87×3, 89), SD 20.13; **(Taṇhā) Bhikkhuṇī S** (A 4.159/2:146×4), SD 10.14; **Pema S** (A 4.200/2:214); **(Catukka) Samaṇa S** (A 4.239/2:238); **(Nīvaraṇa) Upakkilesa S** (A 5.23/3:19), SD 74.3; **(Pañc'aṅgika) Saddha S** (A 5.38/3:29), SD 45.9; **Iddhi,pāda S 2** (A 5.68/-3:83); **(Pañcaka) Sīlavanta S** (A 5.87/3:114); **Phāsu,vihāra S** (A 5.94/3:119); **Samaṇa Sukhumāla S** (A 5.104/3:131); **(Asekha) Ānanda S** (A 5.106/3:134); **(Pañcaka) Āraṇṇa S** (A 5.110/3:135); **(Pañcaka) Gilāna S** (A 5.121/3:142); **(Pañcaka) Piya S** (A 5.232/3:262); **(Chakka) Āhuneyya S 2** (A 6.2/-3:281); **(Chakka) Indriya S** (A 6.3/3:282); **(Chakka) Bala S** (A 6.4/3:282); **Soppa S** (A 6.17/3:300, 301); **Udākūpamā S** (A 7.15/4:13) = Pug 7.1 (SD 28.6); **Arakkheyya S** (A 7.55/4:83×2); **Paricchattak'ūpama S** (A 7.65/4:119×2); **Vinaya,dhara 1** (A 7.71/4:140); **Vinaya,dhara S 2** (A 7.72/4:141); **Vinaya,dhara S 3** (A 7.73/4:142); **Vinaya,dhara S 4** (A 7.74/4:141); **(Sattaka) Āhuneyya S** (A 7.95/4:145 f); **(Aṭṭhaka) Saddhā S 1** (A 8.71/4:314); **(Aṭṭhaka) Saddhā S 2** (A 8.72/4:316); **(Navaka) Assa Khaḷūka S** (A 9.22/4:400), SD 73.7; **Pabbateyya Gāvī S** (A 9.35/4:422), SD 24.3; **(Dasaka) Jhāna S** (A 10.8/5:10); **Santa Vimokkha S** (A 10.9/5:11); **Sen'āsana S** (A 10.11/5:15), SD 96.5; **(Dasaka) Sīha,-nāda S** (A 10.21/5:36), SD 81.2; **Adhimutti,pada S** (A 10.22/5:38); **Kosala S 2** (A 10.30/5:69), SD 64.-15; **Ākaṅkha S** (A 10.71/5:133), SD 82.12; **(Dasaka) Āhuneyya S** (A 10.97/5:200); **(Saddha) Subhūti S** (A 11.15/5:340), SD 45.1(4.1);

(Arahatta) Nanda S (U 22/23, 24×4), SD 43.7;

Deva,sadda S (It 82/75); **Kalyāṇa,sīla S** (It 97/97); **(Tika) Te,vijja S** (It 99/100); **Vbh 344×2**;

Āsā S (Pug 3.1/27×3); **(Tika) Citta S** (Pug 3.5/30); **Pameyya S** (Pug 3.12/35); **Sota,gāmī S** (Pug 4.27/62); **(Catu) Samaṇa S** (Pug 4.29/63); **Umujjana S** (Pug 7.1/72) = A 7.15 (SD 28.6).

100524 101004 150903 150919 151016 160520